NIAGARA FRONTIER TRANSPORTATION AUTHORITY

COMMITTEE MEETINGS

MAY 26, 2022

Transcript of Video Recording of Proceedings held at NIAGARA FRONTIER TRANSPORTATION AUTHORITY, 181 Ellicott Street, Buffalo New York, STENOGRAPHICALLY TRANSCRIBED BY LARA K. SENIW, NOTARY PUBLIC.

MEMBERS IN THE BOARDROOM: 1 Sister Denise Roche, Chair Commissioner Michael Hughes, Vice Chair 2 Commissioner Adam Perry 3 OFFICERS IN THE BOARDROOM: 4 Kimberley Minkel, Executive Director John Cox, Chief Financial Officer 5 STAFF IN THE BOARDROOM: 6 Vicky-Marie Brunette, Deputy General Counsel Christine D'Aloise, Director, Risk Management and Special Projects 7 Patrick Dalton, Director, Internal Audit and Corporate Compliance Tom George, Vice President, Operations 8 Dejuan Hardy, Chief Diversity Officer Darren Kempner, Director, Government Relations and Development 9 Karen Novo, Vice President of Human Resources and Talent Management Brian Patterson, Chief of Police Mark Pereira, Manager, Procurement 10 Chris Ruminski, Manager, Financial Planning & Analysis John Schaefer, Vice President Engineering and Facilities Management 11 Helen Tederous, Director, Public Affairs 12 Lee Weitz, Director, Aviation 13 MEMBERS ON THE PHONE: 14 Commissioner LaVonne Ansari, Secretary Commissioner Joan Aul, Treasurer 15 Commissioner Anthony Baynes Commissioner Margo Downey Commissioner Stephen Tucker 16 17 OFFICERS ABSENT: David State, General Counsel 18 CHAIR ROCHE: Good morning. We're going to start our meetings 19 20 scheduled for the Niagara Frontier Transportation Authority for today 21 which is May 26th, 2022. And I'd like to start the morning with an 22 opportunity just to pause and to consider and reflect on all that has 23 happened in the last month since we have been together and to seek 24 guidance as we move forward. 25 [MOMENT OF SILENCE] 26 CHAIR ROCHE: And we will start this morning with the Audit, 27 Governance and Finance Committee Meeting. And I'm going to begin by 28 calling on Patrick Dalton to give us an update on the Audit Status.

COMMISSIONER BAYNES: Good morning. Anthony Baynes.

CHAIR ROCHE: Good morning, Anthony.

3 MS. MINKEL: Good morning.

COMMISSIONER BAYNES: Thank you.

MS. MINKEL: Do you want to take over? That way you'll have

a record of it.

1

2

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

MR. DALTON: OK. I will start off with The Audit Status

Report on page two (2) of your reports. On page two (2), you can see the trifecta of Buy America audits. These are every vendor that we purchase buses from and as such since we are receiving these buses, we will be doing the post-delivery Buy America audits before we pay these invoices so... Starting off with New Flyer, we received one of the electric buses. They're expensive buses, they're about \$1 million each, and they're looking to get paid, so they'd like to get this Buy America audit done as soon as possible. So, we have gotten the information and we expect it to wrap that up probably tomorrow and have the report issued and into your emails probably next week. Likewise, we have Nova Bus, we have next month, we will be taking delivery of ten (10) more clean diesel buses by the end of June. So, Nova's ahead of the game. They actually gave us the information ahead of time so they're looking to get paid as well. So, needless to say, we're getting that information and we'll be doing that Buy America audit as well. The last one is Gorman, that's the small buses, and we have received those buses and I actually have issued that Audit Report. You probably saw that in your emails and the required certifications are complete. Interestingly enough on the Buy America front, we have some Board Action today for Gorman for some more small buses, so again we'll be doing a pre-award Buy America audit on that as well. And I think we have some future bus

orders coming on down the pike and we'll probably be doing pre-award Buy America audits for New Flyer as well as Nova in the next couple of months. We have three (3) more pre-award Buy America audits coming down the pike. You'll be seeing those as well. So, quite a few on the Buy America front. So, on page two (2), just wanted to highlight the one on the bottom of the page, Truman Arnold Companies, TAC Air, that is in the wrap up stages so you will be seeing that audit report probably within the next couple of weeks.

2.4

On page four (4), I would like just to highlight at the bottom of the page, "Model Governance Principles". This is our Sarbanes Oxley testing for our internal controls over financial reporting. This is one of the reports that we do as part of our financial statement package. We do a certification of our internal controls. Kim, John and myself sign off on that as well as we sign off to certify the financial statements. And we gave all of the testing to Lumsden & McCormick, our external auditors, and they do what they call a "Attestation Report" as part of our financial statement package. So, that is in wrap-up stages. We'll have that information to Lumsden on Thursday of next week. So, I'm pleased to report that is in the wrap-up stages as well. Big exercise to do the testing of internal controls.

And, of course, on the last page, page five (5), is our Corporate Compliance items. The big PARIS Report that we have is an internet-based reporting system. PARIS stands for the Public Authorities Reporting Information System. It's a lot of financial and operational data that we upload into PARIS as required by Public Authorities Law and that is due at the end of June. So, once our external auditors give their report to the Board next month, on audited financial statements, then we get going and start getting the

certification of the PARIS Report. So, that is the Audit Status Report for the month of May.

CHAIR ROCHE: Lot of reports. Lot of work.

MR. DALTON: Thank you.

CHAIR ROCHE: Thank you very much. Any questions for Patrick?

Thank you.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

2.4

25

26

27

28

MR. DALTON: Thank you.

CHAIR ROCHE: And performance. Christopher.

MR. RUMINSKI: Good morning. Excuse me. Good morning,

Commissioners.

CHAIR ROCHE: Good morning, Christopher.

MR. RUMINSKI: For the April performance, for the month we had

a favorable budget variance of \$924,000.00 and this is resulting from higher than budgeted operating revenues and operating assistance of \$623,000.00 or 3%. Metro passenger fares were \$114,000.00 favorable to budget. BNIA concessions and commissions revenues was \$154,000.00 unfavorable to budget as enplanements were below what we forecasted for the month. New York State Transit Operating Assistance was \$45,000.00 favorable to the month, to budget for the month, and this is going to be an ongoing favorable variance. When we adopted or set up this budget originally, we based our STOA number on the Executive Budget and the final enacted budget is about \$500,000.00 higher than we had in our budget, so we have about a \$45,000.00 favorable variance every month on STOA going forward every month. And finally, mortgage and sales tax revenue combined were about \$425,000.00 favorable to budget. There was also lower than budgeted operating expenses, with a favorable variance of \$350,000.00 or 2%. Personnel for the month was \$163,000.00 or 1%favorable. Utilities were \$67,000.00 unfavorable to budget and that is

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

primarily due to higher than budgeted Metro electric and gas billings. Insurance and injuries were lower, excuse me, were favorable to budget by \$38,000.00 due to lower Metro claim loss reserve appropriations. And finally, general business/other was \$163,000.00 favorable to budget due to lower parking management costs at the BNIA due to a, relating to the lower parking revenue generated. For the month on a business center basis, BNIA was \$240,000.00 favorable to budget for the year due to expenses being about 6% below budget and that's partially offset by lower-than-budgeted concessions and commissions revenue. NFIA was \$55,000.00 favorable to budget for the month due to higher-thanbudgeted concessions and commission revenue, partially offset by operating expenses that were unfavorable to budget by about 12%. Transportation centers were \$46,000.00 favorable to budget due to operating expenses being favorable for the month and that was mostly lower than budgeted personnel and safety and security expenses. Property and development, excuse me, property and development was \$10,000.00 unfavorable to budget for the month of April due to lower than budgeted rental income and it's partially offset by 7% lower than budgeted operating expenses. And finally, Metro is \$593,000.00 favorable to budget for the year. Again, that's due to favorable variances in fares, STOA and mortgage and sales tax revenue. Are there any questions on April performance?

CHAIR ROCHE: Questions? Nope.

MR. RUMINSKI:

the spreadsheet here on the screen summarizes the total budgeted and actual capital expenditures for the 2022 fiscal year. This is both the NFTA equity funded and the grant funded portions of capital projects. At the end of the year, at March $31^{\rm st}$, we were at \$81 million favorable

Next up is the quarterly capital report. This,

to budget, meaning we anticipated spending about \$81 million more on capital projects during the year that we ultimately did spend. This is typical of variance. Over the prior year we were favorable by about \$66 million for 2021 and this is just a result of projects or equipment that we initially, when we initially set up the budget, we thought we were going to perform these tasks in the upcoming year and for various reasons, they might, they were pushed out probably a year or more. The largest reasons for the variance in 2022 are relating to a couple of different business centers. Metro, for example, bus and rail, they were favorable to budget as expenditures on various projects budgeted for fiscal 2022, will be partially or completely moved to fiscal '23 and this includes the fare collection system, electric bus purchase, the Erie Canal Harbor Station refurbishment and some fastener and pad replacement projects. BNIA is favorable to budget mostly due to runway snowblowers and the Buell Avenue parking lot which are completely or partially postponed until the fiscal '23 year. And NFIA was under budget as the rehab and reconstruction project for taxiway Delta was moved to fiscal 2023. And finally Central Admin is under budget, mostly due to MIS projects that are being partially or completely moved to fiscal '23.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

2.4

25

26

27

28

The next report is the capital budget variance analysis. The prior one was what we expected to spend within a fiscal year. This report is individual projects, how they performed relative to their starting budget. This analysis shows projects that were greater than \$500,000.00 that closed out in 2020, 2021 or 2022 fiscal years. And we do this report on a quarterly basis. So, in the last quarter of fiscal 2022 there were two (2) projects that closed out that were over \$500,000.00. There were twenty-three (23) CNG buses. They

were delivered in a prior fiscal year but the whole project was completed last fiscal year and that project was on budget. And also, there was the BNIA parking structure elevator modernization project and that was 11.5% favorable to budget. And due to lower costs, due to some parts that were found when they took apart the elevators that were in better condition than they initially thought so they didn't need to be replaced, so that had some savings on the project, so that's why there is a favorable variance on that project. Are there any questions on the capital budget reports?

CHAIR ROCHE: Questions? No?

MR. RUMINSKI:

And finally, the cash management report. Total cash at the end of April was \$194 million which is \$724,000.00 ahead of budget. We are ahead of budget due to Metro passenger fares, STOA, mortgage and sales tax revenue being favorable to budget and also lower operating expenses Authority-wide has led to a stronger cash position than we initially had projected for the month. Are there any questions on cash managements?

CHAIR ROCHE: Good reports.

MR. RUMINSKI: Thank you.

CHAIR ROCHE: OK. And that brings us to the Safety Report.

Lyle.

MR. DEATH: Thank you Sister. Good morning, Commissioners.

23 | MULTIPLE COMMISSIONERS: Good morning.

MR. DEATH: The April Safety Report begins on page fifty-

eight (58) of your binders and on the slide behind me. During the month of April, there were three (3) recordable injuries, with one (1) of these resulting in lost time, a total of two (2) days away from work.

Injured employees included one (1) bus operator injured when their bus

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

26

27

28

was struck in the rear, one (1) bus operator with a back issue caused by a seat adjustment issue, and one (1) maintenance employee who strained his back locking in a bus fare box. When compared to the previous year through April, you'll find that recordable injuries are down twenty-six percent (26%), lost workday cases are down ten percent (10%) and days away are down forty-four percent (44%). Just one comment for the month, earlier this week we released our newest safety pit crew campaign to recognize the dedication and teamwork exhibited by our Central Stores Team while they were acquiring and distributing COVID safety supplies over the past two-plus years. They already had full time jobs, but they buckled down to take on this added responsibility and flawlessly ensured our employees had masks, hand sanitizer, disinfecting supplies and numerous other COVID supplies. I think we have a picture of them up here - Larry, Don, Ziggy, Ken and Shawn just have done and great job and continue to do a great job making sure we all have our COVID supplies. Absent any questions, that concludes the Safety Report.

CHAIR ROCHE: Excellent report.

MR. DEATH: Thank you.

CHAIR ROCHE: ...and so are they. Any questions or comments for

Lyle? Thank you very much. And Government Affairs. Darren. Always have something to report.

MULTIPLE COMMISSIONERS AND MR. KEMPNER: Laughter.

MR. KEMPNER: That's a lot of pressure.

25 MULTIPLE COMMISSIONERS: Laughter.

MR. KEMPNER: The Grants and Government Affairs Report is on page sixty-two (62) in your packet. Under Federal Government Affairs,

U.S. DOT has been focused on rolling out the Infrastructure Bill,

changes and new programs and I've listed some of those initiatives on the first page there and then on the next page, on sixty-three (63), the Safe Streets and Roads for All Program, has been announced. What this does is it funds comprehensive safety action plans for regions, focused on pedestrian, bicycle and non-automotive safety and then it also funds projects and I've listed certain types of projects that could and would benefit our ridership as well as the region. The region, our region, does not currently have a comprehensive safety action plan, so we as a region, plan to apply for funding for that plan out of this program. And because of the name, this would be the time to kind of buff up on your trivia knowledge of the difference between a street and a road. I can answer that after if you are wondering...

MULTIPLE COMMISSIONERS: Laughter.

MR. KEMPNER:

2.4

announced. [Laughter.] The other, while U.S. DOT is focused on rolling out those programs, Congress has been focused on the next FAA Reauthorization. The current FAA bill expires next September and there are two (2) topics of many that they are focused on but most recently the pilot shortage, which I believe Lee is going to talk about a little bit later, and some tweaks to legislation that would possibly assist in that shortage as well as sustainability. And I summarize the hearing that was held last week in the House T&I Committee on addressing climate change at U.S. airports. There are a number of FAA programs that support sustainability and Congress is currently looking at strengthening, bolstering, changing those to address the climate change demands. On page sixty-three (63) under State Government Affairs, post budget, our focus has really been on accessing all the appropriated funding that has been made available as well as legislative

I didn't know until the program was

developments as the State Legislature session looks to wrap up next week. And, then the last item from my report on page sixty-four (64), we applied to FAA the Contract Tower Competitive Grant Program. This program supports FAA contract towers and rehabbing, relocating, refurbishing those towers and so our Niagara Falls Airport tower, which is eligible under the program, is in need of some attention, so we applied for a citing report which is an official FAA document that would help us further design and construction of a new tower at Niagara Falls. MR. WEITZ: It was built in 1939. MR. KEMPNER: Laughter. Barring any questions, that concludes

12 my report.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

28

COMMISSIONER PERRY: Can you explain what an FAA Contract Tower is? 13

MR. KEMPNER: Oh. I'll do my best. Maybe Lee can help me out.

They're typically airport owned and then the FAA contracts with a contractor to staff the tower. Did I get that about right?

MR. WEITZ: Yup.

MR. KEMPNER: OK.

As for our airports, instead of having FAA MR. WEITZ: employees in the tower, they hire contractors, several contractors throughout the United States to perform this work and we are one of those airports at Niagara Falls.

COMMISSIONER PERRY: Thank you.

24 CHAIR ROCHE: Great.

MR. KEMPNER: OK. Thanks. 25

CHAIR ROCHE: Public Affairs. Helen. 26

27 MS. TEDEROUS: Good morning, Sister. Good morning,

Commissioners. The Public Affairs report for April includes eighty-four

(84) media mentions, a very busy month. The biggest story was the 1 arrest of the woman at the Buffalo Airport after she opened an 2 emergency exit. Also, there was a Buffalo Bill onboard who was tweeting 3 4 the situation. We also had stories on our recruitment efforts and the 5 electric bus unveiling. There you will find our breakdown of our 6 business centers, media categories and top dates for news. Our 7 publicity, as I mentioned, was very robust, causing \$2.1 million in 8 earned media, mostly online because the story did have national 9 coverage. Our media advisories are listed and internally, we completed twenty-five (25) creative services jobs. And finally, community 10 engagement and social media, we had a wonderful turnout for our 11 12 electric bus unveiling, which was on Earth Day, which was a great way to connect the importance of the electric buses and that we received 13 14 close to 17,000 social media impressions for the electric bus 15 unveiling, and it was just a wonderful sunny and bright day for Buffalo. It was a very nice event. Barring any questions, that 16 17 concludes my report.

CHAIR ROCHE: Thank you kindly.

MS. TEDEROUS: Thank you.

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

CHAIR ROCHE: OK. Human Resources. Karen.

MS. NOVO: Thank you, Sister. Good morning, Commissioners.

So, the HR Report starts on page seventy-two (72). I just have a few items to go over. Of course, you know our horrific tragedy that we've had over two (2) weeks now, and then the recent, most recent one. This report was written, you know, after the tragedy, or right after the tragedy, but I just want to let everyone know, and let the Board know that, immediately after, on Sunday, Kim, of course, put out an Executive Director message to all of our employees. As you know, how

1 affected, our locations are close to the tragedy, our employees, we 2 have 1,500+ employees. So, our EAP services reached out right away to 3 us, and we put out all the information, we made sure employees who came 4 in on Sunday, they got it up on screens. You know we've got the 5 documents that they provide of ways to get ahold of the EAP, they had 6 24/7 support system line. So, we really just, you know, it was an 7 effect to everybody, so we just wanted it to be communicated to all of 8 our employees and our employees are using the assistance and that's 9 good that they're able to reach out and feel comfortable talking to other people with this recent tragedy. In addition to that, our Chief 10 Diversity Officer, Dejuan Hardy, he went out right away to all of the 11 12 locations, started talking to employees, asking them about, you know, there is fear out there, there's sadness, there's everything that we're 13 14 all experiencing right now. So, we're reaching out, we continue to 15 reach out, talking to employees, knowing that we're there for them for support. Our bus operators who all do a wonderful job out there, 16 17 driving down these streets, our mechanics, everybody, airport, it's a 18 tough time as we all know. I don't have to talk about that, but we just 19 have the support out there and we continue to keep the support out 20 there as we update things, especially now that they are going to 21 services, we have additional support that EAP keeps continuously 22 putting out. So, I just want the Board to know that we are definitely 23 reaching out and keeping in talking with our employees out there, making sure everybody's safe, as well as we can keep them safe. So, 2.4 that's on the EAP and everything we've been doing. 25

Another note, just to update the Board, Supervisory Training, we've got a lot of new employees lately, you've got a lot of new supervisors and unfortunately during COVID, we couldn't do much

26

27

28

1 training one-on-one. So, with Tom's group and the airport, we're working on doing for our new, new supervisors and some that 2 have been here three to five (3-5) years, that need updated, new, 3 4 improved supervisory training, we are bringing outside professional 5 development to do training for all of our supervisors at different 6 levels and we're also doing some internal, like how to handle, like who 7 to contact for different leaves, how to handle CBAs, how to understand 8 things, so we're really engaging our employees and helping them get 9 through things and knowing the contacts, who they contact for certain situations. So, that is starting next week, Wednesday, June 1st. Yes, 10 it's June 1st already! It's going through September. So, it's a lengthy 11 12 timeframe of training but we think it's an investment in our employees and we think it's going to be well worth it, and I will keep the Board 13 14 updated on that. So, just to continue on to page seventy-two (72), it 15 just shows once again our recruitment efforts, still recruiting, people are still retiring, people are, you know, still leaving due to 16 challenges of the job so, we continue recruiting, but it's been 17 consistent. We've been, our twenty (20) that I think I mentioned last 18 month, of the operators are still there. They're going on their fifth 19 20 (5th) week, and we have not lost one (1) operator yet, I just confirmed 21 that before we came up.

CHAIR ROCHE:

Good.

23 Ms. NOVO:

22

24

25

28

And that's a good sign. Normally we do

lose a few during those classes so we're going into week five (5) so that is promising.

26 | CHAIR ROCHE:

Laughter.

27 Ms. NOVO:

On the next page, page seventy-two (72),

or seventy-three (73), I'm sorry, it just again, it just talks about

1 the different things that we're doing, you know, we continue to do open 2 houses, we work with Northland, all our partner communities, all of the high schools that we've been going to, and now with June coming up, our 3 4 Recruiting Team is going to be very busy because they're now going 5 back, reengaging, OK, I came to talk to you, so what are the next 6 steps. Are you, do you want to come, do you want to engage with us, do 7 you want to see what NFTA is really all about, well, we have a job for 8 you. So, those are the things that we're doing right now. And then I 9 just wanted to update you in the Authority openings, where we are. We've come down slightly on the operators, again, that number changes, 10 we have retirements, we have things that we have, we have movement. 11 12 Mechanics, we're doing pretty good on. It's consistent. We've actually hired about I think we're up to about eight (8) since November, maybe a 13 14 little bit more, but we're getting there. So, we're moving in the right 15 direction. It's always going to be a challenge, I think we are going to continue to have these challenges, but we're moving in the right 16 direction. So, it's been consistent, so just a... that will conclude my 17 18 report unless there are any questions.

CHAIR ROCHE: That's excellent. BNIA has one (1) opening?

MS. NOVO: In the mechanics. In the mechanics. Only for mechanics. They have others in the management and administrative and custodial staff. So, yeah, yeah.

CHAIR ROCHE: That's very good. [Laughter.]

24 MS. NOVO: Yup.

19

20

21

22

23

25

26

27

28

MS. MINKEL: So, there's progress but it's important to point out, you know, overall, on the mechanics side, we have thirty-eight (38) openings, which is a significant number, forty-four (44) operators, twenty-three (23) maintenance and twenty-one (21) management

and administrative. It's a competitive market out there... 1 2 CHAIR ROCHE: It sure is. MS. MINKEL: ...and one of the other things Karen and her team 3 4 are working on because I'm very concerned and we are starting to see 5 it, is burnout among our employees. Particularly from my staff, with 6 the past two (2) years, they have been dealing with the pandemic, they 7 have been dealing with the public, we still, the State still requires 8 masks, for example, in transit and airports and they have to deal with 9 the public who's also getting frustrated so working with EAP, we're going to be specifically targeting burnout, to see what we can do to 10 help our employees and our staff. 11 CHAIR ROCHE: 12 I know it seems like we've gone from one 13 tragedy to another tragedy... MS. MINKEL: 14 Right. 15 CHAIR ROCHE: So, it's never normal... 16 MS. NOVO: Right. Right. CHAIR ROCHE: 17 ...and it's high maintenance to keep that up for 18 two (2) to three (3) years. MS. MINKEL: Yup, yup. And for our folks, the tragedy that 19 occurred on the $14^{\rm th}$ of May, we have one to two degrees of separation. 20 21 That's how close it is. The Chief and his Staff were there, they were 22 responding. Did an incredible job. The Chief has focused on providing 23 assistance and counseling for those individuals who responded. Our 24 operators, there were a number of operators who were there, who also helped and responded. And then we have employees who live in that 25 community who sadly lost loved ones because of the event. So, Karen and 26

her team have done an excellent job and Dejuan, working with Staff.

And the need to have our bus service from, at

27

28

CHAIR ROCHE:

different times to different places...

MS. MINKEL: Yep. Absolutely.

CHAIR ROCHE: Is summer a better or harder time to recruit? I

mean high schools are closed.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

MS. NOVO: So, great question, but I don't think I, I don't think there's one I could say is better than the other. It's just consistently, it's been the challenges that we've had have been so consistent and I think it's going to be, I think it's going to continue on. I mean our bus services, of course, is a little different in the summer but still, we still have to recruit, you know we have to move forward because of our numbers of our vacancies, but I don't see one time that is better than the other right now, I mean, as we're moving out of COVID, if you asked me that in different years, but as we're moving out of COVID now, it's been pretty consistent as far as the challenges. I mean, you know, even talking to some of our vendors, our insurance companies and so forth, they, we had a meeting just the other day and they talked about their challenges. They're saying "please, be patient with us due to customer service" and all that because of the challenges of their hiring needs as well. So, no matter who we talk to, everybody's going through the same challenges, whether it be fast food, or you know, to us, to schools. It's just, it's tough. So, I yeah, that's a great question but I can't, I don't ...

CHAIR ROCHE: So, there's just no trends...

MS. NOVO:

There is just no right time right now. Yeah,

it's just been, yeah, I've just seen the trends pick up since like the

COVID which makes sense, but it's not, I mean we still have, I'm not

going to say we're anyways near where we should be, because we still

have a long way to go. And I think it's going to continue, I mean,

1 retirements, the age of our employees, where we are and all that, just, so it's going to be a continuing challenge going forward. I don't see 2 anything in the near future that's gonna say "OK, we're good". I think 3 4 it's going to be a continuous challenge. And the trades too. We talk 5 about operators, but trades, the mechanics that keep the buses going. 6 That's a tough job too so it's, we're short there, so they have to keep 7 these buses on the road, so they're, it's tough. So... 8 CHAIR ROCHE: Well, you have been very good at finding new 9 ways to recruit, new places, new opportunities. So just, keep it up. 10 [Laughter.] MS. NOVO: [Laughter.] Yes. Good teamwork by all. 11 CHAIR ROCHE: 12 Are there questions of Karen or of others? If not, I can't believe it, but we finished our meeting exactly on time, 13 14 and I thank you all for being part of it. 15 16 CHAIR ROCHE: Thank you Helen. Now we will begin the Aviation 17 Committee Meeting of the Niagara Frontier Transit Authority for May 18 $26^{\rm th}$, 2022, and I will turn it over to Commissioner Perry. COMMISSIONER PERRY: Thank you, Sister. For today's meeting of the 19 20 Aviation Committee, we're going to start, where it seems like we've 21 been starting almost forever, with the Airport Improvement Project 22 update with Mr. Schaefer. 23 MR. SCHAEFER: Great. Thank you, Commissioner. Good morning. 24 MULTIPLE COMMISSIONERS: Good morning. MR. SCHAEFER: The AIP Status Report for May. The Buffalo 25 26 Airport Runway 5/23 rehab. This month we issued the notice to proceed 27 one (1) and two (2). This is for administrative work and some fall work

which will be runway lighting and guidance signs. That's for

28

installation this fall. The notices also included some long lead items for next summer's work which will be the pavement and drainage work scheduled for 2023. So, this gets them in the queue for some materials ahead of time so that it doesn't become an issue for us then. Buell Avenue parking lot. The consultant is redesigning their parking lot drainage due to their inadequate removal of storm water in their original design. So due to this, as well as the many processes involved with it, we terminated the contract for convenience for construction. We have our consultant working towards putting a new bid package together for the new design and are anticipating getting the out for bid as early as the end of June.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

2.4

25

26

27

28

Also at the airport, so there has been a lot of enthusiasm about electric vehicles, throughout the nation, throughout the state. Of course, we have buses and charging over at Cold Spring. Well, the Buffalo Airport is no different. We have on a smaller scale, have charging stations for customer parking. Our rental cars have a demand. There is interest in it recently being asked. So, that has prompted us in Engineering to put a study together. We're in negotiations now with term consultants to take a look at our infrastructure, take a look at demands, so some of the obvious ones are customer parking, rental cars, might be things like on the airfield there, some baggage totes, some of our own vehicles. And then there is future, where are we going with it, so making sure our infrastructure locally can handle it. Immediately, it cannot, I can tell you, with all those things was mentioned, it cannot. So, it does warrant a study, and at the end of it, there is a plan. Are we going to have these charging stations? What are we designing to? and what will max that out? You know what our limits are even moving forward? So, the point here is we

2.4

are working towards getting a study together and preparing for the short term and long term. An important thing to note is not only in the demands of vehicles but what type of charging demands: one (1) hour, two (2) hour, four (4) hour or eight (8) hour. So, all of those play into it because it all means a bigger draw, or a bigger amperage draw, that we have to be equipped for, so we're working towards it, and then ultimately to our plan and then we will find funding to do so. And lastly, Niagara Falls Taxiway D's rehab. Our construction contractors, asphalt, milling and drainage works in progress and it's on schedule to be complete by the end of this calendar year. And that concludes my report unless there's any questions.

COMMISSIONER PERRY: Any questions regarding the Airport Improvement Project? And hearing none, let's go to the Aviation Business Group items. And Mr. Weitz.

MR. WEITZ: Thank you, Commissioner Perry. Good morning,
Sister. Good morning, Commissioners. Before we go to the slides, I'd
like you to go to page A-10 in your books. I just want to talk a little
bit about the Key Item Report for Buffalo. So, the April financials
only compare actual to budget in current month to prior year. Since
this is the first month of the fiscal year, this is no year-to-date
data. April of 2021, we're still recovering, so the comparative data
between this year and last year is a little difficult to analyze but
you'll hear me mention a lot of comparisons to the year before, April
'19, which is a better comparison to what we're doing now. Buffalo
enplanements were 21% below budget, but you have to remember that we do
our planning for the budget for enplanements a year in advance and
airlines are constantly changing those numbers monthly so, it's not
really reflective of what's going on. We're definitely improving in

enplanements at Buffalo. Enplanements are up 75% compared to last year 1 2 but we're still down about twenty-two percent (22%) when you look at fiscal year '20. And I will talk a little bit more about this in the 3 4 air carrier market share slide that's coming up. If you turn to page A-5 12, talk a little bit about revenue per enplanements. They've increased 6 in every category as you see there, other than auto rentals, which is 7 calculated on a minimal, minimum quarantee basis. So, last year when we 8 had less passengers, it looks like the revenue per enplanement is 9 higher, but we're actually doing very well in car rentals, but the numbers are just falsely, look, make those numbers look better. Since 10 October of 2021, the auto rentals have recovered to or exceeded our 11 12 2018 or '19 numbers. Go to page A-13 in your book which is the parking revenue. Revenue is up 7.07% compared to April of 2019 and the total 13 14 number of cars parked is down 26% which means we're getting people 15 parking in the garage that are actually staying in the garage for a longer period of time versus what they used to do in 2019. So, that's a 16 plus. Long term parking is down 10% versus 2019 and overall, we are 17 down about 5% compared to 2019. So, we're getting close. On page A-14 18 and A-15 are the Niagara Falls financials. Enplanements are on budget 19 20 and 84% favorable to April 2021 which is kind of skewed because 21 obviously last year there wasn't much going on. Parking revenues are up 22 444% compared to April of last year, and that is mostly driven by the 23 opening of the Canadian border. Obviously, that has helped tremendously 24 at Niagara Falls. Well over 50% of the cars parked at Niagara Falls are Canadians. And the revenue for April this year versus last year was 25 \$106,660.00 versus only \$19,000.00. So, a huge jump. 26

Now we'll go to the slides on the screen. Yeah, we just talked about that. Yeah, leave it right there, Lara, thanks.

27

28

MS. SENIW: OK. You got it.

MR. WEITZ:

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

which as you see was, they were 170,031 in April, and if you look at 2019, they were at about 216,800 so we still have a little ways to go, but we're obviously trending in the right direction. Next page is the Niagara Falls enplanements. We're at 7,755 versus April of 2019 was 14,561. Obviously, it's almost a 50% reduction. Obviously, Spirit was operating a lot more back in 2019. They're only operating to Myrtle Beach right now two (2) days a week, and that's going to end in June, on June 4th for the year and then we'll have to see what happens with the merger between Spirit and Frontier or whatever is going to happen with the merger. Hopefully, they'll be back next year but we'll have to wait and see. And Allegiant is still flying to the three (3) Florida cities: Punta Gorda which is near Ft. Myers, Tampa/St. Pete and Orlando/Sanford Airports. Next slide. Again, we talked a little about the parking report. Our April of fiscal year 2023 revenue in the parking garage was \$505,525.00, versus back in 2019 it was \$472,154.00 so we're ahead of the 2019 numbers in the garage. And in the long-term parking, we're at, we were at \$1,038,384.00 versus \$1,156,186.00 in 2019 so just about five percent (5%) below what we saw in 2019. So, we're getting real close to our parking revenue recovery. That's it for the financials. Now we'll go into the pilot shortage slides.

We'll talk about Buffalo enplanements first

So, as you can see the industry is having a huge problem with pilot shortages and a lot of it is due to the age restrictions. The pilots have to retire at age sixty-five (65), once they reach age sixty-five (65) they have to retire. And this crisis has been accelerated because the pilots are retiring at a faster rate than the new pilots enter the field. U.S. airlines need about 14,500 new

28

pilots each year until the year 2030 and according to the recent labor statistics, America only produces about 5,000 to 7,000 pilots annually so as you can see that's a huge gap between the number of pilots retiring and the number they're hiring. And of course, COVID-19 did not help with the situation. By late 2020, air travel demand had dropped, you know, seventy-five percent (75%) due to the lockdowns and then what happened, and then airlines started to run out of their PPE money to pay the pilots to sit home. So, they started offering programs for early retirement and a lot of these pilots took advantage of that program and started to retire so it created a huge problem. Next slide. And then eighteen (18) months later, we flash forward eighteen (18) months, and the travel demand came back, now faster than was expected. So, now we have a huge shortage of qualified and trained pilots which means that the airlines are starting to cut back their schedules so that they can meet the demand and provide good customer service to the passengers. We're still seeing some stories where flights are getting cancelled and there are no flights available for these people for three to four (3-4) days which is kind of a horror story, but they're trying to cut back these schedules for the summer, so they have the adequate number of pilots to staff all the flights that they're scheduled. And you see some of the numbers compared to 2019, United Airlines systemwide is down around thirteen percent (13%) in flights, Delta is down about sixteen (16), American about eight percent (8%) and JetBlue is down about ten percent (10%). Next slide. For Buffalo specifically, you can see we have about 12.5[%] fewer seats as compared to 2019. And I looked at some numbers at Buffalo, I just wanted to share, I just wanted to mention what the seats looked like compared to 2019 for this coming year.

MS. MINKEL: While Lee's looking for that, you know, just by way of comparison, when we had to reduce service on Metro, we cut it back by eight percent (8%) due to driver shortage. Whether it's ground or in the air, it is affecting travel across the nation and certainly

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

here in Western New York.

MR. WEITZ: So, scheduled seats in 2019 for Delta for example, scheduled flights were 636 versus 428 today. That's what scheduled at Buffalo. JetBlue, they're at 194 now versus 370 flights in April 2019, and Southwest is a huge difference, 337 flights in April of 2022 versus 552 in 2019. So, a huge difference in flights out of Buffalo based on their schedule to us. Now, they are exploring some, you know, some alternatives, to, at least in the short-term including increasing the retirement age to sixty-seven (67). A lot of the foreign carriers, Europe for example, I think the retirement age is sixty-seven (67) other there so they're looking at that. They are also looking at, you know, recruiting foreign pilots to come to the United States and fly for some of our carriers. Of course, all the airlines, you've probably seen in the news, a lot of these airlines now are trying, are putting together their own training programs instead of waiting for the colleges or the Air Force to train these pilots. So, they're putting together their own programs to try to expedite the training programs. Of course, you know, they need to have at least 1,500 hours flying in order to qualify to fly one of these jets. Next slide. That's it on the pilot shortage. Any questions on the financials or the pilot shortage? COMMISSIONER PERRY: Western New York being the birthplace of

commercial aviation, with Consolidated Aircraft, Curtiss Aircraft, and then aerospace throughout the decades with Bell Aerospace and all of these, all of this background, and at least Erie and Niagara's

```
Community Colleges, two international airports, are any of our
 2
          Community Colleges working to address this issue of training pilots for
          what looks like to be unlimited job opportunity nationwide?
 3
 4
    MR. WEITZ:
                                   Nationwide and good paying jobs as well.
 5
    COMMISSIONER PERRY:
                                   Very good paying jobs, great benefits, you can
 6
          go anywhere... I heard something about Niagara County Community College
 7
          working on this, are we, are we knowledgeable?
 8
    MR. WEITZ:
                                   We're engaged with them. That is exactly it.
 9
          There is a gentleman named Joe Wolfson who has been in contact with me
          several times. He is working on a program with Niagara Community
10
          College and would like to get that up and running. He's looking for
11
          some grants right now from the FAA, he is talking to the FAA, trying to
12
          get some grants to get the program up and running, but a, we've been in
13
14
          touch quite a bit.
15
    MS. MINKEL:
                                   And we understand there's two parts to it:
          pilots and also maintenance of the aircraft, so NCCC is working on both
16
17
          of those shortages.
    COMMISSIONER PERRY:
                                  Yeah, I would imagine that the aviation
18
          mechanic side is probably even more acute.
19
20
    MR. WEITZ:
                                   Yeah.
21
    COMMISSIONER PERRY:
                                  I would assume, because ...
    MR. WEITZ:
                                   Yeah. Just like Tom is short you know, all
22
23
          these mechanics, the aviation mechanics are tremendously short.
24
    COMMISSIONER PERRY:
                                   So, we don't hire pilots or mechanics...
    MR. WEITZ:
25
                                   No.
    COMMISSIONER PERRY:
26
                                   ...but it affects our service and our revenue and
27
          everything else, so, having to do with aviation.
28
    MR. WEITZ:
                                   Exactly. Yup. Exactly.
```

COMMISSIONER PERRY: Any other questions on any of the material? 1 MR. WEITZ: OK. Got a couple other slides. COMMISSIONER PERRY: 3 OK. 4 MR. WEITZ: Next slide. So, we had the Aviation Snow 5 Symposium at the end of April, early May this year and Buffalo was the 6 winner of the Balchen Post Award which was established in 1976. And the 7 purpose of this award is to promote better snow and ice control and to 8 recognize those individuals responsible for outstanding performance. 9 So, I brought down three (3) of our outstanding performers from the 10 Buffalo Airfield: Dave Wachowski, Pat Diebold and Frank Badaszewski. Frank and Pat are both supervisors in the airfield and Dave is an 11 12 operator in the airfield and they brought the award with them to show 13 us... COMMISSIONER PERRY: 14 Alright. 15 CHAIR ROCHE: Good. Good. 16 COMMISSIONER PERRY: Congratulations. MULTIPLE COMMISSIONERS: 17 Clapping. MR. WEITZ: 18 We also had one of our gentlemen, Sam Nevilles, who wasn't able to make it today, but he won the Operator of the Year 19 20 Award for Buffalo, so we cleaned up in the awards category this year, 21 winning multiple awards. CHAIR ROCHE: Laughter. 22 MS. MINKEL: 23 Even though he is not with us, we do have him 24 on the screen. COMMISSIONER PERRY: There he is. 25 MR. WEITZ: There he is up on the screen right there. Yup! 26 27 CHAIR ROCHE: Good. Good.

And according to my calculations, this is the

28

MR. WEITZ:

ninth (9th) time that we've won the Balchen Post Award at Buffalo. We've had numerous honorable mentions as well. So, outstanding job over the years and great job guys and thank you very much for your service.

COMMISSIONER PERRY: Thank you.

1

2

3

4

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

27

28

5 MS. MINKEL: Yeah. Great work.

6 CHAIR ROCHE: Thank you.

MR. WEITZ: And I just want to mention two other things

real quick. June 9th Sun Country starts service to Minneapolis two (2) days a week, Sundays and Thursdays, it's only for a short period of time because they have an extra aircraft in their fleet for the summer months. So, it will run from June 4th until September 5th. But it's good news for Buffalo if the numbers look good and they like operating out of Buffalo, there's a good chance they'll come back and with other service in future years. So, it's a great news story and then also on June 9th, it is going to be a very busy day at the airport, we have a grand opening in our food court for Bocce Pizza and BurgerFi.

COMMISSIONER PERRY: When is that?

MR. WEITZ: June 9th.

MULTIPLE COMMISSIONERS: Laughter.

MS. MINKEL: Yeah, I'll send something out...

MR. WEITZ: Kim will send out the invitations for both

22 those events.

23 MS. MINKEL: And maybe samples.

24 CHAIR ROCHE: Laughter.

25 | MR. WEITZ: And that concludes my report.

26 COMMISSIONER PERRY: Thanks. Any questions? And that concludes this

Aviation Committee Meeting, Sister. Thank you.

CHAIR ROCHE: Thank you very much. So, the Aviation Committee

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

1

3 CHAIR ROCHE:

Good morning. We are going to begin the Niagara

Frontier Transportation Authority Surface Transportation Meeting for May 26, 2022, and I am going to ask Commissioner Hughes to take us through it.

COMMISSIONER HUGHES: Thank you, Sister. Good morning, Everyone. We do have a few discussion items Tom George is going to walk us through.

We'll start off with a fare system update?

MR. GEORGE: Yes. Thank you and good morning. We have a couple items this morning that we would like to discuss relative to the fare system. OK. So, we are going to go through a MetGo update. MetGo as you can see there is some stuff here and we're going to talk a little about that, our go live plan, the transition process we're going to go through relative to the go live plan. We'll take briefly about marketing and incentives and then we also want to talk a little bit about our reduced fare program that we'd like the Board to consider and have some discussion on. So, if I could, I'd gonna to start with the MetGo update. So, MetGo is the global term we are using to refer to our fare collection system, right. And so, it's just a little bit of history, we had some focus groups back a number of years ago, it was actually quite a while ago because Doug Hartmayer actually was part of doing that process. Gives you an idea of how long this project's been undergoing. So, we did go through some outreach and focus groups, and we selected the brand MetGo for our new fare collection system. So, when you hear the term MetGo, that refers to the brand essentially that we're using here at NFTA-Metro for a fare collection system. So, all the fare boxes are installed in the buses, they're operational, they

28

have been for quite some time, so that part of the process is essentially complete. The PAL pilot, so in the paratransit vehicles, we actually have readers, smartcard readers essentially, those are all deployed and installed, and we have a number of our customers that are out using those in a pilot program and testing those and that goes through June 3rd. And when this PowerPoint was presented, we already had sixty-five (65) rides. We've also been having our operators tap on them too just to test the system out. The majority of the fare collection is operating without issues, so things are going fairly well at this point in time, we're rather pleased, we are still tracking customer and employee input on the challenges we receive and working with our vendor on that. The fare gates are fully installed in the stations so that's been rolled out and our fencing is complete in the seven (7) of the eight (8) stations, University Station is the only one and that's actually anticipated to be completed this week. So, we'll have all of our fare gates in place. They are all wide open right now and actually they are, people are able to walk through them in most cases so they're there, but they're not operational at this point in time. Also, our public web portal and mobile app are undergoing review and testing so those are complete with the product. There will be a mobile app that goes along with it that will act as one of the methods that you can access our systems to the MetGo mobile app and that's undergoing testing. And then there's also a public web portal that goes along with that to manage your account. This is what we refer to as an accountbased system. It's not a card-based system so everyone will have the ability to have an account which will be managed through the app or the web portal. Those systems are all completed and undergoing testing. And we're continuing to work with both our corporate pass programs and our

28

social services. We distributed a large number of passes on a monthly basis to our Social Service partners, Erie County, Niagara County, different groups like that use social service distribution so we're building a web portal so that they can manage that process themselves. Also, our corporate pass account holders also will have a web portal so that they can manage their account so that that is nearing completion and the testing is under undergoing as well. So, we talked about a "Go Live" plan. "Go Live" is essentially the term we're using to take go from what we have today is our old "flash a pass", buying day fares on the bus. Paper cards that we hand out to people which are then broadly distributed to anybody who wants to ride the bus and left them wherever you may want to pick those up. So that's that's what we have today. So, we're going to "Go Live" midsummer. Basically, we're gonna have a period, a transition period, where you can use both the existing media and the new system. There's two approaches to going about "Going Live". One is referred to as "The Big Bang Theory". "The Big Bang Theory" is today we turn everything you've used for years off and turned the new one on. We are not doing that. We are taking the transition process where we'll have both products available during the period that you can work your way from one to the other. Last, late in the fall, we anticipate having the system fully operational and at that point in time those other what we call legacy media or legacy past products will go away. And by the end of the year, we anticipate having the system complete with the testing basically complete and the system fully accepted. And then at that point time, we'll also have the fair capping product that we've talked to the Board about before. Fair capping is our approach by which the technology will be built into the system for those account holders, a company system, will never pay more than

28

\$25.00 in a week and will never pay more than \$75.00 in a month. So, we're working through that. That was a bit of a late add-on. So, that will be completed by the end of the year as well. So, what does the transition plan look like? So, we wanted to try the seamless, the seamless transition I talked about not doing "The Big Bang". So, from July 1st through September 30th, we will continue to check fare products on the system. Our operators will be out there on the buses. You'll still be able to buy day passes the fare boxes will continue to accept cash. They'll continue to accept cash even after the new system is available, but when you pay your cash at this point in time, if you pay your \$5.00, the operator will still issue you a day pass or you can have an account and you can use the MetGo system. So, we're trying to transition people from one to the other over this period of September or July 1st to September 30th. August 20, August of '22, this summer, will be the last month we plan on selling our legacy system. So, if you go to one of our partners, be it a Tops, as an example, and you buy a "Flash a Pass" on a monthly basis, you pay \$75.00, you get a pass, you use that for the month, August will be the last month you'll be able to do that. In September, you'll have to go to Tops and buy a MetGo account and put \$75.00 on that. The process would be the same, but the card will be different. Current card today has a mag stripe on it. The new cards are all smartcards. There'll be a tap and go product. As well as, if you don't want to do a card, you can go to the mobile product as well. MetGo rail gates will remain open through this period so even though we have the technology in some of our customers' hands and they have the ability to tap and go, we'll leave those open and we'll continue the proof of pay payment fare, fare enforcement efforts that we do today, until we go to the fully available system. That is

28

anticipated for October 1st, we'll close the gates and at that point in time, we're going to be looking at an incentive which I'll talk about a little bit to see where we are with our penetration rates. Our goal certainly is to have as many people in the new system as possible. We're going to talk about an incentive to see if we wanna do that to move more people toward that. You know how good the uptake is between now and then, we'll have further discussions with the Board in the summer, specifically in September about that. So, that's really our approach for what we're doing. The next, oh go back one, sorry. The other thing I just wanted to say about is important here is the MetGo app I talked about that. With the card, there's a \$2.00 fee. So, if you want to go to a ticket vending machine or a vendor to get a card, there's a \$2.00 surcharge to get that card for the initial use. That card will be good essentially forever. Whatever forever is, the card won't last forever certainly, but it will be good for a number of years, and you can continue to use that. So, when you go to either a TVM or to a vendor to get that, there's a \$2.00 charge for that card. If you do not want to use the card and go to a mobile app product, certainly there's no charge at all for the mobile app that will be free on the app stores. OK, now go ahead to the next one. So, one more. Marketing. You'll see here a couple couple things that are marketing that we're going again. The fact the MetGo is out there and we're promoting MetGo heavily. There's a number of pieces to the marketing. Our employees are critical to this piece. So just as many people don't understand what MetGo is throughout the community, our employees, we've been teasing this for a long time. At this point in time, we'll be developing handbooks for every employee which will have all the needs, no questions. Obviously, our operators that are that are transit

28

ambassadors are frontline employees who need to go to the depth of the of the knowledge of the system, so they work with the customers and explain it. So, there's a marketing campaign for our employees. There's a marketing campaign for the community as well. A teaser campaign is what you're seeing here, you'll see it on our buses, you'll start to see it in our shelters, it will be out on social media. It's on our website. So, we're working on those marketing products and we're working with the consultants, on different concepts, one's a tap and go concept, which we're talking about. So, you'll see "Go, Go, Go." which plays on the MetGo taps on it plays on the tap and go. I'm not a marketer if you guys don't know that by now [laughter]. But this is this is the approach that they're taking to try to get that uptake on what MetGo means and get that uptake in the community on what this new product is. So, the marketing is ongoing, and you'll start to see more and more as we move on. The next one is the incentive program. This is really brief. We want to consider this. As I said, we'll come back to the Board in September and talk about what our penetration rates look like, how our transition plan is going. But one of the thoughts we do have is to offer an incentive for the entire month of October for those individuals who have registered for an account whether it's using the card or whether it's using in the app, those individuals that have an account to give them half fare for the month of October. So, this is something we'll consider based on our penetration rates. This is one idea that we have. We've talked about a number of others. This one seems like the easiest to implement for us and it seems like it would be a big incentive for people to move into the program. Certainly, there's two approaches to this. Some agencies have taken their approach, whereas you can continue using cash, they charge an increased fee to the riders once they move to the system. We thought we would prefer to use a carrot program rather than the stick and say "if you move to the program, we'll give you an incentive to reduce your fares for that month". Try to get people to move into it. Our ultimate goal is to get as many people into this as possible, and get as much cash out of the system as possible. It will really help speed the transition of individuals on and off the bus and onto the system. Really has some advantages. So, we'll come back to you again September and talk about this once we see what that uptake is.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

2.4

25

26

27

28

The next thing I wanted to talk about is, and this is not related to MetGo. This is a different incentive program, something we've been looking at, you know, looking at equity in our community, looking at the challenges a lot of people in our community have. We've identified a group of individuals that work in our community that have challenges in transportation. So, what we're looking at is moving on a targeted pilot program. I do not have a board action for you today. This is for discussion today, but it is something we think is, is an opportunity for us to take a bigger role in helping some individuals in our community. We'd like to reduce the cost of transit for those individuals in need. There are segments of our population certainly that are what we would consider on the margin. There's a lot of people out there that make just enough money that they're really unable really to do a lot, but they don't qualify for a lot of assistance. So, with these folks that are on the margin, I know Kim has used the term "benefits cliff" that they are essentially on, there are a group of individuals that we are targeting to try to assist them with transportation. This is individuals that are not receiving other aids, such as SNAP or cash public assistance. The challenge we have is that

28

we don't really want to be in the business of venting people in the community for this. So, we've worked directly with Erie and Niagara Counties through their social service departments and identified at this point that the county Child Care Block Grant Program that they administer. These are individuals that are essentially in that category that I discussed previously, their cost burdened by transportation. So, what we what we're looking to do, next slide, is to move a program where we've identified approximately 1,300 families in Erie County and 250 in Niagara County that are part of this program today and the County vets them and puts them into the program. We would simply adopt a program where we would say to those individuals, if you if you're on this list and you fill out a half fare program with the NFTA, we will then issue you a half fare product. So, this is not free transit. This is a reduced fare transit program by which we will identify individuals in the community of need and provide them with a half fare product to try to assist them with their transportation. We're looking to do a pilot program for this reduced fare, it would be a one-year pilot. Again, Erie and Niagara County would be the lead on this. It's an opportunity for us to really see the impact, now keep in mind those numbers that I presented are county-wide. A large number of those individuals really aren't transit users so there is certainly a lower penetration rate than that so it's not a large number of people, but we'd like to try it, see what kind of impact we can make in that community and see if there are other opportunities to do this and how well it's received and frankly how well we can administrate it. So, we would just cross-reference that list when they come in and if they are indeed on the list provided to us by the county, we will then issue those. We anticipate and this is very conservative, we anticipate that

1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 6 | 7 | 8 | 9 | 10 |

COMMISSIONER HUGHES:

like to launch it?

the cost would be as much as \$10,000.00 a month. I don't really believe it will be that much, but that's kind of a conservative number. I don't believe it would approach that. But once again we think it's a great program, I've been a proponent of this for a long time, and I think it's a good opportunity for us to promote it. So, I throw that out there today for the Board to consider. We'll be looking to most likely if there's and if it seems like a positive approach, we'll be looking for a Board Action next month to try to advance the pilot program. So, I throw that out there and offer any kind of questions or comments on the presentation or specifically on that program.

COMMISSIONER HUGHES: Is this being done elsewhere like in New York, or other states or across the state?

MR. GEORGE: Really where I got most of my, I have a relationship with the Allegheny County Port Authority, Pittsburgh. They're doing a lot of this type of work. I really haven't solicited others in New York, but I've followed their program, I think it's been successful. It's been really, really positively received by the community, it's helped ridership and it's brought more people into the system, so that's really where I have, but we really haven't researched New York State. If there's any comments or questions, get those back to us. Other than that, that completes the presentation for today.

Timing of the half fare program, when would you

MR. GEORGE: Ideally, we'd launch it in September. That would be the ideal time for us. We've already had the advance conversation with both counties. We wanted to make sure that they were able to support this before it went live, so I think they're prepared. It's not really a big lift for us really because we have the half fare

program. We administer it now. This is just another box to check and another company to check with. Our service generally rises in September and things change at that point so that is the ideal time.

COMMISSIONER HUGHES: OK. Finances?

otherwise I will just keep rolling.

2.4

MR. GEORGE: Yep. Finances. There's not a lot to discuss today and Chris had gone over those earlier. We are favorable mostly across the board mostly due to passenger fares, operating assistance, as well, so our revenues and assistance are favorable this month, first month of the year so first month references year-to-date as well. We are a favorable across the operating expenses as well. We did have certainly a little challenge with our utilities, higher electric and gas billings, but that's been a trend we've seen so that may continue on, we're not sure exactly, again a lot of that depends on weather, as well. But generally other than that we're seeing a positive across the board on most things. A little bit of challenge on maintenance and repairs but some of that can be seasonal as well. A positive financial report. And if there's any questions, please feel free to interrupt me,

On the Metro Initiatives Status Report, battery electric buses, I just wanna report to the Board that the chip shortage is affecting delivery of better electric buses as well. Right now, our manufacturer is in the process where they're building buses with technology put into those, testing them, moving them to the back row, pulling the technology out, building a new bus. So that's a recurring theme. We're looking towards the end of the year now to get our remaining nine buses. I will keep the Board apprised of that as it develops. They were saying end of August, and now we're hearing it could even go longer. So, I don't wanna, I don't wanna promise the end

```
of August at this point in time. It's just, just being dragged out.
 1
    CHAIR ROCHE:
 2
                                   Tom, what about the one that you have? Will
 3
          that be in use some place?
 4
    MR. GEROGE:
                                   Yeah, I think it eventually it will. We're
 5
          still in testing of that and we're doing a lot of a lot of work with
 6
          it. But I think we will look to put that into service at some point in
 7
          time, we're certainly not gonna ride with it, just let it sit in the
 8
          garage.
 9
    CHAIR ROCHE:
                                   Lonely.
    MR. GEORGE:
                                   We'd love to have all of them certainly.
10
    CHAIR ROCHE:
11
                                   Laughter.
    MR. GEORGE:
12
                                   And frankly the challenge with the diesel buses
          as well. There's cost implications, there's schedule implications. The
13
14
          delivery of vehicles in our environment is no different than for the
15
          public buying cars. It's a huge challenge across the board that we're
          seeing. I do anticipate bringing in another Board Action next month for
16
          more electric and diesel buses and the lead time on those is again
17
          significant. So, we need to get that in front of the Board...
18
    COMMISSIONER HUGHES:
                                   What's significant? Eighteen months?
19
20
    MR. GEORGE:
                                   Yup. Yup. Before it was a year and again, it is
21
          going to really depend on the supply chain issues that come through.
    CHAIR ROCHE:
22
                                   Was there a significant difference in the cost
23
          of them, from the first group that you ordered which I presume was
24
          before the escalation?
    MR. GEORGE:
                                   There certainly is an increase above those. It
25
26
          is probably on the order of magnitude of 10% which when you are
27
          spending $1 million on a bus, is a lot of money. So, that's a
28
          challenge. We're just getting the final numbers now. There is
```

escalators built into the contract with the contractor so they go through those escalators and that's all establishes what those will be. So, we'll have the numbers for you next month to show you exactly what they are. Staff is still working on getting those quotes finalized.

There's an RFP on the street for the Division Street Transit Hub. That's something we've been working on, getting consultants available for it, and I did go through the full presentation on where we are with the fare collection project. So. that's my initiatives status report for today. I know John will follow with the Capital Projects Report.

Metro Capital Project Update for May. Light

COMMISSIONER HUGHES: Any other questions for Tom? If not, John?

12 MR. SCHAEFER: Good morning.

2.4

MR. SCHAEFER:

CHAIR ROCHE: Good morning.

rail's padded fastener replacement project, phase 10. If you recall this project's objective was to remove and replace existing rail and rail fasteners on track 1 and 2 between LaSalle Station and University Station. All construction activity will be completed by next week. Therefore, the single tracking effort will no longer be required in that area. At DL&W Station, the track work contract with Cerrone, the trackwork and the pedestrian crossover, that work is planned for completion in June of this year, so next month. You may recall there was a change order related to the Special Events station? We're delaying that so we can, due to the Heritage Point and our own Church Street Station work. They'll be using the Special Events Station as needed because there is real tight restrictions on pedestrian traffic in that area between the two (2) different job sites so it will complement that and they'll starting in January on that demolition once

17

19

20

21

22

23

25

26

27

28

that Special Events is no longer needed. On the station proper, submittal reviews are in progress and on-site work is planned to start in July. Embedded rail replacement at the 400 block of Main Street.

This project is in design with Mott McDonald. This is the tracks 1 and 2 between Mohawk and Church as well as adding, replacing some track and track bed as well as adding the crossover at the Eagle and Main area. So, Mott McDonald is putting a design rational report together. We expect to see that in June. This month there is a Board Resolution for Board Approval for Supplement No. 1 for Mott's contract. This is for design services to replace rail, rail fasteners, about a half mile of track just between portal and just south of Allen Station. So, since they are already working on that track area it makes sense for them to continue in that area, just working on rail track bed passing down to the portal, which is the first part of the underground. And that concludes my report unless there is any questions?

16 | COMMISSIONER HUGHES:

Just on the light rail rebuild, car

number 107, that's the last one?

18 MR. SCHAEFER:

Yes, that's the last one, yes. So, what

you might glean from there is there are some unfortunately, they parts issues have lingered into there as well as staffing. Good news is it is on premises and is being worked on for programmable logic for the truss.

COMMISSIONER HUGHES:

Thanks. Back to you Tom?

24 MR. GEORGE:

Yeah, on the metrics, there only one

thing I wanted to point out on our ridership. Last month, I talked about our ridership being back to about fifty-five percent (55%). Kind of creeping up, but there is a snapshot in time this month of twenty-two, versus last month. Bus ridership is up fifteen percent

(15%,) but rail ridership is up fifty percent (50%) from where we were last month. That's still below where we want to be but it kind of shows the snapshot of, I think, we're starting to come out of things a little bit and see some returns, so I just wanted to share that with the Board.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

And then the only other thing I had for today is the Committee Reports. There was no Citizens Advisory Committee Meeting in the month of April. Our next meeting is June 2nd at 5:30 p.m. That will be held here at the MTC again and then we will be looking to do a tour which we usually do once a year with the group, probably for our August meeting. So, we'll look into that. Hopefully we'll be able to use the electric bus for our tour as the mode of transportation and the Committee will be excited about that. The Accessibility Advisory Committee meeting did have a Committee, did have a meeting on April, in April. The notes are in the book. A couple of items. There was some concern about our change in trips, so we did provide data and metrics to the Committee, and we had a huge increase year-to-date over our missed trips and late, and late trips. There was a couple factors involved that. One was our shortage of operators. The other was the fact that our ridership had rebounded significantly relative to the previous year almost back to normal, over eighty percent (80%) of our previous, and so the metrics were a little bit skewed due to the fact that they were based on a very small sample size than the previous years so certainly our numbers did go up a bit. But we did have some challenges as well. Just a note, Karen in HR had talked about the recruitment, the staff that's entering into service right now. There was twelve (12) operators that were entering into service through that last class. Six (6) of those are going to paratransit. She talked about

the current class of twenty (20) that are in training now, we anticipate eight (8) of those going into paratransit. So, that will include the paratransit roster by fourteen (14), barring any, any erosion on the other side of that, which has, you know, has a tendency to be. But those are good numbers which I think that will help us, help us address some of those challenges. We talked about rider alerts and some challenges with that. We're engaging the Committee in the website redesign so that they can have input specifically on the accessibility portions of that website which are critical. We talked about Erie Canal Harbor design and letting them know that the challenges just as John had just spoke about relative to the use of Special Events, and how individuals with challenges can use that system and how we're going to address that. We did provide them with an update on the MetGo and specifically talked to them about the pilot program that they're using relative to checking out the MetGo system for paratransit. And we also have a "No Strand" Policy that the Committee had gone through and then provided us a lot of input on so we could finalize the "No Strand" Policy and make sure we don't leave anyone essentially behind. And now we're moving into a subscription policy review where we're trying to enhance the ability of individuals to make subscriptions, so a paratransit rider has basically two (2) courses. One is they can call for a ride to go wherever they want or if they work or go to a regular recurring event, they can just do a subscription. So, we're trying to enhance the subscription process for them, and we'll reduce their need to interact with scheduling, to use the IBR and just make that more consistent for those and we're vetting through that process with the Committee as well.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

2.4

25

26

27

28

And then, last but not least, we talked about the

2.4

\$750,000.00 paratransit funding that we got for a study that was submitted in the state budget. We talked a little bit about that, when we'd be moving once that money gets allocated to us and obligated. Just a last note, we do have eight (8) new paratransit vehicles going into service as we speak. They are onsite and we are in the process of equipping them with the technology so those will be rolled out over the next few weeks into service. And the vehicles that we are retiring are old. To steal an old adage from our recently retired maintenance director, "You can't weld rust".

CHAIR ROACHE: Laughter.

MR. GEORGE:

So, we're pleased to see these buses go by the wayside. The service life of a paratransit vehicle by Federal standards is five (5) years. These buses are upwards of twelve (12) and fourteen (14) years old, so we're pleased to be able to introduce those to the community.

COMMISSIONER HUGHES: Will those go up for auction? Or scrap? What are you going to do with them?

MR. GEORGE: We'll auction them if somebody's willing to buy them. Yeah. So, take them. We'll take \$1,500.00 and move on. So, that's, that's my report unless there's any questions.

COMMISSIONER HUGHES: Any other questions for Tom? OK, Chief
Patterson? Public Safety Report?

CHIEF PATTERSON: Good morning. Good morning, Sister. Good morning, Commissioners. While it's not part of my official April, April report, it's probably appropriate to note and reiterate the outstanding job that the Transit Police Officers did with respect to the mass shooting that took place last week. Our officers are, our transit officers are embedded in the community, servicing all of our

transportation needs. So, when the call came out, "all hands on deck" essentially, transit officers were there. So, I just want to acknowledge them before the Board, that they did an outstanding job, and using what I call high emotional intelligence really to get the job done. And then as the Executive Director stated, we did rabble around them and rabbled around our officers to ensure that to the best of our ability we will rehab them, if you will, and prepare them to go back out there.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

2.4

25

26

27

28

In keeping with our core mission, transit police officers responded to 125 calls for service in the month of April. Of those calls for service, 82 cases were closed, 21 arrests were made, 18 cases have investigations pending and three (3) cases have unknown dispositions. At the Buffalo Airport, our most common occurrences, when I come before the Board, I talk about this crime personality that you can expect in our areas of responsibility, I kind of refer to them throughout the report. But at the BNIA, the most common occurrences were property, confiscation and SIDA violations. At the Niagara Falls Airport, the most common occurrences were suspicious activity and property. On a side note, in the month of April, we had several reports of drones in the Niagara Falls area and so officers responded accordingly to that call. Light rail, our most common occurrences are larceny, harassment and fights. Our bus input, the most common occurrences were property damage, PPOS, we call them, bus accidents. And at the MTC, officers responded to harassments and property, so that kind of gives you kind of an understanding of the calls for service that we go on and kind of our dispositions in how we handle them.

Administratively, we have completed the following sections towards accreditation: Section 1. is completed, Department

2.4

Role and Authority; Section 2. Organization and Management; and we are currently working on Sections 3. and 5. Rules of Conduct and Patrol Functions. In the month of April, training, officers attended an armor training sponsored by the New York State Rifle Maintenance. Our training is ongoing, but it is very purposeful. All of our training is to ensure that officers are prepared to do, to do the demanding job. As we move forward, we're looking more at cybercrimes, obviously, mass shootings and other, other crimes that are on the rise, that we need to prepare for and we're doing the work.

Lastly, I'd like to talk about, before I go into crime prevention strategy, I'd like to talk about our community input. We're looking forward to "Coffee with a Cop" on June 2nd, between 10 and 12 at 474 Michigan Avenue and please, I do not want to hear any donut jokes.

MULTIPLE COMMISSIONERS: Laughter.

CHIEF PATTERSON: It is "Coffee with a Cop", but this is part of our community input, our desire really to engage with the community and get to know them and so we will conduct some of these innovative gatherings in the future. We are also, are working with an association nonprofit called Victory Sports, and their mission of good is to use donated sporting equipment for underprivileged youth. And we've kind of attached ourselves to Victory Sports and in the back of our trunks in the near future, you will see footballs, soccer, soccer balls, other equipment so that as our officers are in the community, we want them to engage in a number of ways and there is no better way than sports. So, another innovation in terms of our community input.

People ask all the time, "Chief, what's your crime prevention strategy with this type of crime and that type of crime?"

28

and you should know as a Board that it's really, I buy into the old adage, "it takes a village". You know my policing strategy is built around this this "it takes a village" concept. So, what we're looking to do is always increase our officer supervision, I'm sorry, our officer presence, but more importantly increase our supervision presence and you'll see that as we partner with, one, we partner internally with our ticket ambassadors, we're partnering with schools, we're partnering with community groups and we're partnering with our federal law enforcement partners. The second thing is we want to leverage and use technology efficiently and we have a bunch of it here so we're using technology also to reduce criminal activity. And then lastly, I'm very passionate about this new way of, I don't know, of fighting crime, if you will, by using a design concept called "crime prevention through environmental design". And essentially, it is a fancy word for it would be like you're hiring an interior decorator to go into your house, and make it, if you have a small house, and you say, you know "I'm gonna hire an interior decorator to make it look bigger". To use design to achieve a certain attractiveness or to achieve a goal. We're doing the same in policing right now and there is really this movement towards using septet strategies to impact crime. Interestingly enough, Kim said to me "it seems like we had a good month crime wise" and I said "yeah, I think so and, and the numbers show it that we did have reduction across all of our part one crimes, if you will". But I reflected on the fare gates that have gone up in the subway stations and believe it or not, that helps and that shapes the environment and that's I think it's favorable and time will tell, but it's been favorable to how it impacts the users coming through that environment to some degree, I'd like to think. It decreases the sight

2 and people move through in a more orderly way, and it's amazing how 3 psychologically, that that impacts and deters disorderly behavior. So, 4 you'll see us implement septet strategies. And the four pillars of septet, and I'll finish with this, are "natural surveillance". One of 5 6 the things I'm asking is that we take a look at subway stations, and 7 especially Utica Station, I would really like to increase the intensity 8 as it relates to light. I think there is an opportunity to really light 9 that area up as you walk in. Obviously, I'll be happy to talk more about a "why?" if anyone's interested. Another pillar is "access 10 control", controlling how people move through space, back to the fare 11 gates. And then the other two pillars are "territorial reinforcement" 12 and "maintenance", and if we implement those pillars in a coordinated 13 14 way and we have the capacity to do so. I think that will greatly impact 15 what we're doing in terms of making people feel safe and reducing crime. That concludes my report. Any questions? 16 Chief, I know you made light of "Coffee with a 17 COMMISSIONER HUGHES: Cop", but if you can explain, you know, what's your intention with 18 that, how are you getting the word out, you know, and what does that 19 20 look like, if someone sits down with one of your officers? 21 CHIEF PATTERSON: So, we've been, we've been working with our 22 Community Relations Division. Helen's been, her team has been great in 23 terms of getting the word out, so flyers, word of mouth obviously. I'm 24 not sure if there's any other media? MS. MINKEL: Social media. 25

lines. It also gives you a sense, of a better sense, of organization,

COMMISSION HUGHES: Yeah.

out in those ways. And you said the intent?

CHIEF PATTERSON:

26

27

28

1

Social media, thank you. So, we're getting it

1

CHIEF PATTERSON: The messaging, the messaging is simple, I think. A lot of folks don't know what transit police officers do and they don't know, and they don't quite understand the range of things that we do. They see us drive by and they're like, you know I'm used to, you know "what's the difference between Buffalo police and transit, so one of the things we want to do is just talk to them about what we do. The other thing is some people don't care if you're an officer, you have a gun, talk to us about the conflict. There's tension in policing, so we want to have just a very real honest conversation. We want to come to the public and we want to do it outside of calls for service. That's the worst time to try to win over folks is when you're going to a call for service. You want to do and it and say "hey, we're people too". So, we're hoping through casual conversation, they'll get a better sense of who we are. More importantly, my officers get a truer sense of the community they serve.

COMMISSIONER HUGHES: That's great. Thank you. Any other questions? That would, that would complete Surface Transportation.

CHAIR ROCHE: Thank you very much, Mike. And now we are ready to take a break and we will return at 12:30 for our meeting today.

21

22

23

24

25 26

27

28