## NIAGARA FRONTIER TRANSPORTATION AUTHORITY

BOARD MEETING

JUNE 23, 2022

Transcript of Video Recording of Proceedings held at NIAGARA FRONTIER TRANSPORTATION AUTHORITY, 181 Ellicott Street, Buffalo New York, STENOGRAPHICALLY TRANSCRIBED BY LARA K. SENIW, NOTARY PUBLIC.

## MEMBERS IN THE BOARDROOM: 1 Michael Hughes, Chair 2 Commissioner Anthony Baynes Commissioner Mark Blue Commissioner Adam Perry 3 Commissioner Jennifer Persico Commissioner Stephen Tucker 4 OFFICERS IN THE BOARDROOM: 5 Kimberley Minkel, Executive Director John Cox, Chief Financial Officer 6 STAFF IN THE BOARDROOM: 7 Vicky-Marie Brunette, Deputy General Counsel Christine D'Aloise, Director, Risk Management and Special Projects 8 Patrick Dalton, Director, Internal Audit and Corporate Compliance Steve Duquette, Chief Information Officer 9 John Fenz, Counsel Tom George, Vice President, Operations 10 Darren Kempner, Director, Government Relations and Development James Morrell, Director, Public Transit 11 Karen Novo, Vice President of Human Resources and Talent Management Brian Patterson, Chief of Police 12 Mark Pereira, Manager, Procurement John Schaefer, Vice President Engineering and Facilities Management 13 Helen Tederous, Director, Public Affairs Lee Weitz, Director, Aviation 14 MEMBERS ON THE PHONE: 15 Commissioner Joan Aul, Treasurer Commissioner Margo Downey 16 OFFICERS ABSENT: 17 David State, General Counsel 18 CHAIR HUGHES: Welcome, Everybody. Welcome to the June 2020 19 Regular Board Meeting of the NFTA. With that, we will call to order. We 20 do have, with the Governor's Executive Order, we do have Members on the 21 phone as well as in person so with that, I will ask Vicky to call the 22 roll. 23 MS. BRUNETTE: The roll call for attendance. So, Commissioner 24 Ansari? Commissioner Aul? 25 26 COMMISSIONER AUL: I'm here Vicky. MS. BRUNETTE: Commissioner Baynes? 27

Here.

28

COMMISSIONER BAYNES:

MS. BRUNETTE: Commissioner Blue? 1 COMMISIONER BLUE: 2 Here. MS. BRUNETTE: Commissioner Hicks? Chair Hughes? 3 CHAIR HUGHES: Here. 4 MS. BRUNETTE: Commissioner Perry? 5 COMMISSIONER PERRY: 6 MS. BRUNETTE: Commissioner Persico? 7 COMMISSIONER PERSICO: Here. 8 MS. BRUNETTE: Commissioner Tucker? 9 COMMISSIONER TUCKER: Here. 10 MS. BRUNETTE: And Commissioner Downey? 11 MS. SENIW: Looks like she jumped off and then jumped back 12 in. Hang on. Sorry about that. 13 MS. BRUNETTEL Commissioner Downey? 14 MS. MINKEL: Hey Margo? 15 MS. BRUNETTE: Commissioner, I think you are on mute? 16 COMMISSIONER DOWNEY: Yes, I'm here Kim. 17 MS. MINKEL: OK, thanks Margo. 18 MS. BRUNETTE: And Commissioner Wilcox? We do have a quorum. 19 CHAIR HUGHES: OK. Thank you. Before we do the minutes, I do 20 want to stop and recognize Sister Denise, our former Chair, thank her 21 for her service and her work in making sure there was a smooth 22 transition to the Chair spot for myself. So, thank you to Sister 23 Denise. With that I'll entertain a motion for the approval of minutes. 24 COMMISSIONER PERSICO: So moved. 25 COMMISSIONER BLUE: Second move. 26 CHAIR HUGHES: Commissioner Persico. Reverend Blue. Do we feel 27 28 like we want to do a roll call?

MS. BRUNETTE: Roll call vote. Commissioner Aul? 1 COMMISSIONER AUL: 2 Yes. MS. BRUNETTE: Commissioner Baynes? 3 COMMISSIONER BAYNES: 4 MS. BRUNETTE: Commissioner Blue? 5 COMMISIONER BLUE: Yes. 6 MS. BRUNETTE: Chair Hughes? 7 CHAIR HUGHES: Yes. 8 MS. BRUNETTE: Commissioner Perry? 9 COMMISSIONER PERRY: Aye. 10 MS. BRUNETTE: Commissioner Persico? 11 COMMISSIONER PERSICO: Yes. 12 MS. BRUNETTE: And Commissioner Tucker? 13 COMMISSIONER TUCKER: Yes. 14 CHAIR HUGHES: Motion is approved? 15 MS. BRUNETTE: Motion is approved. 16 CHAIR HUGHES: Thank you. Moving on. Executive Director's 17 report. 18 MS. MINKEL: Thank you Chairman. A couple of things for the 19 Board. So, for those of you who missed the Audit, Governance and 20 Finance Committee report, I just wanted to highlight and recognize 21 Staff. This is the first time in the history of the organization since 22 we've been recording, which goes back to the nineties, we did not have 23 a single recordable accident. We are a high hazard industry and so, 24 that is absolutely remarkable. So, I just wanted to highlight that. It 25 is something we're very proud of, and it certainly takes years of hard 26

I also wanted to mention to the Board that we

work to get there.

27

received our MWBE program performance report from New York State and for the first and second quarter, I am pleased to report that again, we received the maximum score available, that means an A+ from the state as we continue to exceed our goals related to MWBE.

I also wanted to mention to the Board that FTA is in. They're conducting a triannual review of our Metro Division. They've been in for... they are doing most of their review mostly remote so it's a little bit different this time. It's a very comprehensive report, they look at twenty-three (23) different areas related to our Federal funding. Cyber security is a new area for us this time around. We expect this review to wrap up some time later next month.

I also wanted to let the Board Members know that on July 8<sup>th</sup>, the former Joint Commission on Public Ethics, or JCOPE, will transition to the new Commission on Ethics and Lobbying in Government so I don't know how you say that...

CHAIR HUGHES: JLO?

MULTIPLE COMMISSIONERS: Laughter.

MS. MINKEL: CELG? That's the new acronym. It will have a new logo and a new website going forward. If you recall, that your financial disclosure forms come from ETHEL. I don't know if there will be a new ETHEL...

MULTIPLE COMMISSIONERS: Laughter.

MS. MINKEL:

...or GERTRUDE. If a new one is coming out, We'll let you know, but the new name is Commission on Ethics and Lobbying in Government. At our Surface Committee, James Morrell mentioned that our express service was reinstated on June 19th, but it was mentioned in our Audit, Governance and Finance, that we continue to struggle with hiring operators, mechanics, admin, engineers, you name it. We continue to

2 past Saturday was a huge success - almost sixty (60) people hopped onboard to go to Knox Farm - really well received in the community. 3 COMMISSIONER PERRY: Wow. 4 MS. MINKEL: So, that's been a wonderful partnership with 5 New York State Parks, Erie County Parks, and it's really a great way 6 for the community to have access to the various parks here in our 7 community. I also wanted to mention that on July  $30^{th}$ , we will have our 8 police physical agility testing for about 110 individuals so that 9 notice goes out tomorrow where we do the physical agility testing 10 portion. 11 Is that for Commissioners? COMMISSIONER BLUE: 12 MULTIPLE COMMISSIONERS: Laughter. 13 Absolutely. You just need to be able to run a MS. MINKEL: 14 mile in under three (3) minutes. 15 COMMISSIONER TUCKER: In under how many minutes? 16 MULTIPLE COMMISSIONERS: Laughter. 17 COMMISSIONER TUCKER: That's a world record right there. I'm good. 18 I'm good. 19 MS. MINKEL: And then the last thing, I just want to 20 recognize our new Chair on the "Healthcare Heroes" Award from Business 21 First. I know he won't mention it because he's very modest but it's 22 certainly well-deserved. It should be recognized ... 23 CHAIR HUGHES: Thank you. 24 MS. MINKEL: ...so congratulations... 25 CHAIR HUGHES: 26 Thank you. MS. MINKEL: ...on that award. 27 28 CHAIR HUGHES: Appreciate it. Doesn't get me too far when I

face hiring challenges. We also mentioned that our Adventure Bus this

get home to 13 Taylor Drive, but we'll take it. 1 2 MULTIPLE COMMISSIONERS: Laughter. CHAIR HUGHES: But I'll take it while I am at work though. 3 Thank you. 4 MS. MINKEL: And that concludes my report. 5 CHAIR HUGHES: Great, thank you. Any questions for Kim? Moving 6 on to the Corporate Report. The Audit, Governance and Finance Committee 7 did meet this morning. It was highlighted by a presentation from our 8 auditors, Lumsden McCormick, with the Authority getting an unmodified 9 clean opinion, no material weakness. Kim or John, I don't know if you 10 want to talk or mention anything about the audit or the process? 11 MS. MINKEL: You know the only thing I want to mention and 12 just to recognize, you know, John, his Staff, Linda Sorrento, our 13 Controller, it's a lot of work putting together all of the information. 14 For the Board Members that weren't here when the auditors presented the 15 financial statements, one of the things they highlighted is we are the 16 only transportation agency that does our own financial statements. A 17 lot sub out the work and one of the very few in terms of government 18 authorities who do their own financial statements, so it's a lot of 19 work. John and his team do an excellent job. I think the fact that we 20 have another clean audit speaks to that and their good work. So, thank 21 22 you. CHAIR HUGHES: Congratulations. Thank you. John, do you want 23 to review the financials? 24 MR. COX: Yes. Thank you, Chairman. Good afternoon, 25 26 Commissioners. If you refer to page eight (8) are the May month to date numbers as well as page ten (10) will be the year-to-date numbers that 27

I will touch on. For the month of May of 2022, we had a positive

19 20

22

24

25

21

2627

28

variance to budget of a little over a million dollars and on a fiscal year to date, we had a positive variance to budget of approximately \$1.97 million. Total operating revenues and assistance were above budget by \$782,000.00 or 3.3% and above \$1.4 million or 3% on a yearto-date basis. And this is primarily due to higher Metro passenger fares because of increased ridership, higher Erie County sales tax, higher mortgage tax, higher revenues in parking at the airports and also higher state transit operating assistance and that's due to an enacted state budget which was an increase over the executive budget which works out to about \$500,000.00 over the course of the budget year and that was partially offset by various other miscellaneous puts and gets. Total operating expenses were below budget by \$288,000.00 or 1.6% for the month of May and \$639,000.00 or 1.8% on a fiscal year to date basis and that's primarily driven by lower personnel services, lower insurance and injuries, safety and security and general business expenses which were partially offset by higher transit fuel, power, utilities and various other puts and gets. Unless there are any questions, that concludes the consolidated financial report.

CHAIR HUGHES: Any questions for John Cox? Hearing none, we have eight (8) Corporate Resolutions for your consideration. I'll ask Kim to review them.

MS. MINKEL: Thank you. The first one is on page sixteen

(16). This is the approval of the financial statements for fiscal year ending March 31<sup>st</sup> of 2022. We did have earlier today the outside auditors from Lumsden and McCormick, Sara Dayton and Seth Hennard, who presented the audit. It's a clean audit. Materially, they did not have any findings. The financial statements will be uploaded, once the Board approves them, into the PARIS reporting system.

16 17

15

19

20

MR. PEREIRA:

18

21 22

24

23

26

25

27

28

Skipping ahead to page seventy-two (72), Staff is looking for an authorization for an agreement with Crowe. This is for accounting-based software. This is to help us with next year's financial statements as the new pronouncements GASB 87 and GASB 96 will be required going forward. The agreement is for a five-year period, with us having the right to renew for two (2) additional one (1) year terms. The estimated cost for this service for the five-year term is \$103,580.00. As was explained earlier, the new GASB pronouncements have to do with how you record and book leases, property leases going forward. We did go out with an RFP for this work. Six (6) proposals were received, five (5) which were considered responsive and evaluated. Crowe was the lowest cost and as you can imagine, since this is a new pronouncement, this is new for everyone out in the industry.

COMMISSIONER BLUE: On that one, we're following the MWBE guidelines, on those, on this particular agency as far as the requirements for this resolution?

MS. MINKEL: We, as part of qualifications and experience, we always ask to see their qualifications. We did not put a, Mark, correct me, we did not have a percentage requirement for this?

MS. MINKEL: Because it's very specialized work and so that's why, it was, it hasn't been done before and it's hard for us to

We did not.

determine who in the market can do it. So, we have to determine who can do it, then we set the goals going forward. Since this is new, that no one's been doing it, we couldn't set goals not knowing who in the industry could do it.

COMMISSIONER BLUE: But we, because of our agency, and because of what we stand for, and especially with, what we're paying particular

companies to do, we can make sure that any company that does business with us, from any gamut, does follow those guidelines because that's what we pretty much set a standard to do. So, even in the proposals, Corporate Resolutions, can that language be in there so that we can find out all these companies and how they stand in MWBE certifications, qualifications and goals? That's the question.

MS. MINKEL:

So, for a lot, a lot of the procurements that we have, we do have that as a requirement. It gets more challenging when it is very specific so for example, let's say I need someone who can take radiation safety measurements. It's very technical, very specific, it's hard to really canvas the market to set goals and expectations as it relates to our procurement guidelines. For most procurements, this is really probably, more of an exception to the rule. Absolutely. Can we set expectations? We're really buying software. I don't know how we measure the performance going forward. I don't know that I am answering your question.

OK. Any of the companies that we deal with, any of the businesses that we deal with, we want to make sure, or ensure, alright, in as far as in the openness and the integrity of the agency, that the dollars that are being spent in companies and organizations that are following our criteria. I know that in any type of procurement, we want to make sure that that is being followed. We owe it to the community to make sure that we are transparent in what we do and the businesses that we do business with. So, it's important that we make sure that's done. It's important that we make sure that it's done to be open and honest because we want to set the standard on when it comes out on MWBE whether it's procurement, whether it's in jobs, or an organization that do business with us, we just want to make sure that

standard is set. And if we put it in there, those companies would meet 1 2 that standard, they will, they will have their application and give us that information. So, we need to make sure that it's done. 3 MS. MINKEL: So, are you asking for some kind of 4 certification that they would sign off, like in this case, it's 5 software. What is it that we should... I'm not. I'm trying to test my 6 understanding. 7 COMMISSIONER BLUE: No, no. Does this company follow the standard 8 practices, especially by the state, MWBE certifications that work for 9 us, even in their development, as technical as it is, and I know you're 10 not saying this, but as technical as it is, there are minorities, 11 women-owned and women are part of this career field. So, are we doing 12 our due diligence to make sure that we're seeking organizations, 13 companies that do this kind of work because this is being done to our 14 organization which also deals with a cultural diverse community? So, 15 you're... 16 CHAIR HUGHES: You're looking to ensure there is more MWBE 17 outreach from the Authority so that other companies... 18 COMMISSIONER BLUE: Yes. 19 CHIAR HUGHES: ...smaller MWBE-types have an opportunity or 20 they're even aware there's an opportunity to bid on stuff like this? 21 You want to make sure that there is outreach, communication, things 22 like that? 23 COMMISSIONER BLUE: Absolutely. 24 MS. MINKEL: And we do tremendous outreach, I mean, that's 25 26 how we get the A+ rating that that we receive. We also are the only agency west of Albany that does the DBE certification so we work and 27

try to help to get those businesses that currently are not certified

certified so that they can be able to apply, not only for jobs for us, 1 but anywhere west of Albany. We participate in different MWBE fairs 2 that the state puts on, I don't know, Mark, is there anything...? 3 COMMISSIONER BLUE: I am aware of all that, I'm aware of all that. 4 It's just that when we approve these contracts, approve these 5 procurements, are these organizations meeting that criteria that we 6 have? 7 MS. MINKEL: OK. 8 CHAIR HUGHES: What she's saying is some can, some can't and 9 there's some that are just some categories where there is just no one 10 in that category that can meet that. 11 COMMISSIONER BLUE: Right. 12 CHAIR HUGHES: And I think that it may be a conversation for 13 another day, I mean you and your team know there's just certain areas, 14 certain industries where you just can't seem to find someone who can 15 meet the MWBE components whether it's in construction or whether it's 16 in IT or what have you... 17 MS. MINKEL: Yes. 18 CHAIR HUGHES: You guys have a good sense of that. 19 MS. MINKEL: Yeah. 20 CHAIR HUGHES: That's an opportunity for the Board to help 21 communicate out, you know if you're in IT or if you're in construction, 22 or logistics, you know, there's opportunities for contracts, you know, 23 going through the NFTA website or the procurement process. 24 COMMISSIONER BLUE: And I'm not, you guys do an excellent job, but 25 26 even in that, just, let us, make us aware that they have met those criterias or there is no one that can meet those criterias. So, in our 27

28

resolution, I'm just saying have another line that says that they have

consistent. My sense of understanding just for... 2 MS. MINKEL: So, I don't know if this helps but for example, 3 six (6) proposals were received, five (5) were considered responsive, 4 so we have minimum requirements that they have to meet. If they do not 5 reply with what is required, then they are considered non-responsive 6 and it stops there, we do not even consider going forward with the 7 evaluation. So, maybe that helps address some of the ... 8 COMMISSIONER BLUE: It helps. It helps address it. Just put 9 in here whether they were, they met that criteria, or not. So... 10 COMMISSIONER PERSICO: Not to interject, but Reverend, if you 11 look at, are you talking about if you flip to page seventy-five (75), 12 the second resolution, where there, I think what you are saying is you 13 know "the NFTA excluded this procurement from SDVOB goals because there 14 are no New York State certified providers of this service". Are you 15 talking about just including a sentence like that... 16 COMMISSIONER BLUE: Absolutely. 17 COMMISSIONER PERSICO: ...in the prior, you know, where we say it 18 just wasn't... 19 MS. MINKEL: Got it. Thank you. 20 COMMISSIONER PERSICO: OK. Perfect. Thank you. 21 COMMISSIONER BAYNES: Thank God for the lawyer. 22 MULTIPLE COMMISSIONERS: Laughter. 23 COMMISSIONER PERSICO: Who knew you would be happy to know a 24 lawyer? 25 MS. MINKEL: Thank you. Got it. 26 CHAIR HUGHES: Thank you. 27 28 MS. MINKEL: OK. So, the next resolution is on page

met or is a sole source provider I mean anything that makes it

seventy-five (75) is an authorization for agreement with Main Street Computing. This is a four (4) year development and support agreement to help us comply with New York State article 19A, certification for our drivers. The development would be in year one (1), the support part of the agreement would start in year two (2) and would include one (1) year of licensing, hosting and maintenance, with two (2) optional years of licensing, hosting and maintenance of the new system for a total four (4) year cost of \$187,800.00. The established MBE, WBE, and SDVOB goals were 1%, 1%, and 0% respectively and they have identified that they will meet those goals and we have excluded them from the SDVOB goals because there are no New York State certified providers of the service. The next one on page seventy-seven (77) is an authorization for agreement with Lumen Technologies. This is for our phone services. This would be a three (3) year agreement. The cost for the services is estimated at \$3,200.00 a month or \$115,200 of the three (3) years. We're switching from a previous vendor to Lumen and the switch will save us approximately \$49,000.00 over the three (3) year agreement and should provide better and more reliable service.

The fifth (5th) resolution is a lease agreement. This is with Digital Surveillance Solutions at 485 Cayuga Road. DSS has been a tenant since 2017. They provide security and access control systems. That's their business. They are asking for a new lease which is for approximately 3,200 of Class C office space and a little over 2,300 of light industrial space. The initial term will be one (1) year and they will have the option of four (4) additional one (1) year options, subject to our approval. Class C office space will be at \$11.85 per square foot and the industrial space will be at \$8.50 for just over \$57,000.00 for the year and then for subsequent years, there will be a

3% escalator.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

The next resolution on page seventy-nine (79) is an amendment with Reef Creations at our 247 Cayuga Road facility. Reef Creation is requesting to amend its existing lease to add a little over 12,000 square feet at 247. The space is currently leased and occupied by Glow Coral and Reef Creation is in the process of purchasing the assets of Glow Coral and they wish to assume the lease going forward. This amendment shall increase their current space to a total of just over 8,200 square feet of light industrial space. It will align at the same lease rate, and it will expire at the end of April 2024. The amendment also includes a 3% annual escalator so the total amount for this twenty-two (22) month lease is just over \$19,000.00. The next lease amendment, this is number two (2) for You First Services at 485 Cayuga. You First Services used to be YSF Pharma is a Start-Up NY participant. They've been a tenant since 2017. Nice to see these startup companies grow and even expand. They're asking to add a little over 1,800 square feet of storage space at the facility. The lease term will be five (5) years starting on July  $1^{\text{st}}$  and expiring at the end of June 2027. They would have one (1) option to renew the five (5) for five (5) additional years with our approval. The initial rent rate is \$4.50 per square foot or a little over \$8,100.00 for the first year and it will be subject to a 3% annual escalator.

The next lease agreement is with GEO DATA Intelligence at 247 Cayuga. They are looking at requesting to lease an additional 387 square feet of Class C office space to add to their existing lease. The term of the lease will be for ten (10) months, and it would run coterminous with that existing lease that they have. They would have the option to renew for one (1) additional year with our approval. The

initial rent rate would be \$12.50 per square foot or a little over 1 \$4,000.00 for the remaining ten (10) months and for the second year, it 2 would be subject to that 3% escalator. And those are the Corporate 3 Resolutions. 4 CHAIR HUGHES: Thank you Kim. My intention is to entertain a 5 motion for a group of all eight (8) of the resolutions unless someone 6 7 wants to pull any of those out? So, with that... COMMISSIONER PERRY: So moved. 8 CHAIR HUGHES: So moved by Commissioner Perry. 9 COMMISSIONER BLUE: Second. 10 CHAIR HUGHES: Second by Reverend Blue. Anybody have a 11 question? Vicky, if you can call the roll? 12 MS. BRUNETTE: So, roll call vote for Corporate Resolutions 13 one (1) through eight(8). Commissioner Aul? 14 COMMISSIONER AUL: Yes. 15 MS. BRUNETTE: Commissioner Baynes? 16 COMMISSIONER BAYNES: Yes. 17 MS. BRUNETTE: Commissioner Blue? 18 COMMISSIONER BLUE: Yes. 19 MS. BRUNETTE: Chair Hughes? 20 CHAIR HUGHES: Yes. 21 MS. BRUNETTE: Commissioner Perry? 22 COMMISSIONER PERRY: Aye. 23 MS. BRUNETTE: Commissioner Persico? 24 COMMISSIONER PERSICO: Yes. 25 MS. BRUNETTE: And Commissioner Tucker? 26 COMMISSIONER TUCKER: Yes. 27

The items pass.

MS. BRUNETTE:

CHAIR HUGHES: Thank you. Moving on to Aviation. Commissioner

2 | Perry.

3 COMMISSIONER PERRY: Thank you Chairman. The Aviation Committee met

earlier today. I was just wondering, are we still transcribing these

meetings? And where are those transcripts available?

MS. BRUNETTE: They are on our website.

COMMISSIONER PERRY: And do we do them inside, like you or Vicky, or

one of the Commissioners types those up?

CHAIR HUGHES: Kim's up all night typing.

MULTIPLE COMMISSIONERS: Laughter.

COMMISSIONER PERRY: I assume we have an outside vendor? Like a

12 court reporter?

13 MS. MINKEL: Yes.

COMMISSIONER PERRY: Thank you. So, the Aviation Committee met

earlier today, and started with Mr. Schaefer and ongoing projects at both Buffalo and Niagara Falls International Airport. Mr. Schaefer presented an explanation of part of the bidding and material supply chain process that we use at the airports. Also, noted the replacement of fourteen (14) passenger boarding bridges which is now in the RFP process. Those are boarding bridges that have been serving over twenty (20) years. And then Mr. Weitz went through the aviation business group items. The May net surplus is better than expected, on budget at both Buffalo and Niagara airports. Garage revenue on a number of metrics—dollars, number of cars and length of stay are continuing to improve, but we still have aways to go. Aircraft are full but lower capacity in carriers is a headwind in reaching pre-pandemic numbers so this is due to pilots, other personnel shortages and the demand that we're seeing right now. We had lots of discussion on general air service disruptions

22 23

24 25

26

27

28

COMMISSIONER PERRY:

MR. WEITZ:

and it is much worse at some airports due to a variety of factors. We still see, it appears, a promise for Niagara Falls International Airport to continue its recovery back to ahead of pre-pandemic levels by spring. And our airports are trending, especially Buffalo Niagara is trending in the same direction as most U.S. airports. Considering our top-notch customer satisfaction, recent improvements to the airport and the plans for future additions to services, the best is yet to come. I was not meaning to quote anybody with that. At any rate, there was also a discussion with the, a discussion regarding the relationship between Niagara Falls International Airport and the U.S. Air Force Base and the renewal of the agreement that we have. I think we always have to remember that the relationship supports both the Niagara Falls International Airport and the Base by sharing costs and helping to justify the existence and the continuation of both facilities. Really one, the case for either one is put in great jeopardy by the other, and certainly the Niagara Military Affairs Council and people who support the base and the many people who work there know that the presence of Niagara Falls International Airport is critical in the case they make to BRAC to keep that airport there and all the jobs and the massive economic development impact on all of Western New York. We don't have any idea what that economic development impact is, do we?

MS. MINKEL: We do for the Buffalo airport. It's \$1.5 billion on an annual basis. The last time NFIA had been done was before the new terminal had been built, and that was a quarter of \$1 million. At that time, Buffalo was \$1 billion. So, it's probably fair to say it's a half million a year.

We'll get an update on that ...

And the combined economic impact of the U.S.

Airforce Base and the Niagara Falls International Airport?

MR. WEITZ: OK.

COMMISSIONER PERRY: Do we, we have some numbers on that, don't we?

MS. MINKEL: Yeah, we, it's a bit dated and you're asking me

to remember...

COMMISSIONER PERRY: Let's update let's update that but we know it has a significant economic impact. And I think probably the last main item that we covered, well, a couple of items, the inaugural flight of Sun Country at BNIA on June 9 of this year to Minneapolis and also Pascal Cohen reported on his attendance at the Air Service Development Conference. The 2022 Jump Start Air Service Development Conference this month, earlier this month in Reno and that's part of our membership of an activity of Air Service Council International. And again, we talked more about the big industry challenges. Pilots are flying massive overtime but there is still a great shortage of pilots causing the overtime. And also mentions of the continuing efforts to develop an Albany flight and the status of potential San Francisco flight. And

CHAIR HUGHES:

Any questions for Commissioner Perry? If then,

we will move on to the resolutions. Kim?

those were the items covered at the Aviation Committee.

MS. MINKEL: There are four (4) resolutions that start on page eighty-four (84). I am going to take the first one and the second one together because they are very similar in nature, and this is for an authorization for a second amendment for the car rental concessions. Similar to what we've done with all of the vendors at the airport, in recognition of some of the impacts that COVID has had on their operation, we have negotiated where we would extend the term of the agreement, keep it the same, pay us the same, but we would take it out

24

25

26

27

28

a couple of years. So, for the first one is for the Buffalo Airport, and the fees and rent would remain as what they have been in the fifth (5th) year of the agreement, whereby they would pay us a MAG, a Minimum Annual Guarantee, or 10% of the annual gross revenues. The rental office counter space would be at \$44.60 per square foot. They also pay us a rental for the parking spaces that they have of \$221.90 per space per month. They have 425 parking spaces at the Buffalo Airport. There is a land lease for the QTA. QTA is Quick Turnaround Area, that's where they do the fueling and the cleaning of the vehicles at the Buffalo Airport. That would be at a rate of \$1.25 per square foot. Maintenance charges totally \$75,000.00 annually and the airport will receive a minimum total revenue amount of over \$14,600,000.00 for the two-year extension starting on March 1<sup>st</sup>, 2023. We think this is really in our best interest. We do not know where air travel is going to go going forward for both sides, but this provides stable revenue and it's in recognition of some of the struggles that they've had over the past two (2) years. So, similarly, the second resolution, which is at NFIA, is with Hertz. Their agreement is a little bit different because it's a different airport. It would still be a two-year extension. There they have preferential use of approximately seventy-four (74) parking spaces. The monthly parking fee is \$40.00 per parking space for those cars and the estimated annual revenue for the two (2) year extension for NFIA would be \$110,520.00.

The third resolution for aviation on page eighty-seven (87) is an authorization for amendment for Falcon Aviation. Currently they have been leasing 240 square feet of space. They are requesting to terminate the lease for that space. They have a more convenient location working directly with our fixed base operator at Niagara

Falls. And they would continue to operate a flight school, as we talk about the shortage of pilots, they want to continue to operate a flight school at Niagara Falls. They use, utilize certified flight instructors for the training but they also now want to expand their business to operate a sightseeing business out of NFIA. So, pending FAA approval, they would pick up passengers at Niagara Falls Airport, they would go on airplane ride going over to Niagara Falls and the surrounding area. They would pay us 3% of the gross revenues generated through the operation of their sightseeing tour business in year one (1) and then in future years, 5% of gross revenues. The term would be for, would terminate at the end of January of 2023, but it would also have four (4) one-year renewal options that would be at our discretion.

And the final aviation resolution. We talked about as part of the discussion items' presentation, this is an authorization for a joint use agreement with NFIA. It would be for a five (5) year term that would expire at the end of June of 2027. As part of the agreement, the delineation of responsibilities for the operation and maintenance of the jointly used facilities are in that agreement. They, the government, is not charged for those facilities in consideration and recognition of the services that they provide to us which includes the Aircraft, Rescue and Fire Fighting services at the airport and snow removal. In addition, we're able to float low cost power of 2.3 megawatts to the military which helps them in terms of future BRAC. I think I remember the number that you asked about before, Adam, but I will double check. I think it's \$937,000.00. It took me awhile and I want to double check that number in terms of the accuracy.

COMMISSIONER PERRY: \$937,000.00?

MS. MINKEL: Yeah. But it is significant that it is

almost \$1 million. And those are the resolutions. 1 CHAIR HUGHES: Great. Once again, will entertain a 2 motion to take all four (4) as a group? 3 COMMISSIONER PERSICO: So moved. 4 COMMISSIONER PERRY: Second. 5 CHAIR HUGHES: Commissioner Persico. Commissioner Perry 6 7 as the second. Vicky, will you call roll? MS. BRUNETTE: This is the roll call vote for Aviation 8 Resolutions one (1) through four (4). Commissioner Aul? 9 COMMISSIONER AUL: Yes. 10 MS. BRUNETTE: Commissioner Baynes? 11 COMMISSIONER BAYNES: Yes. 12 MS. BRUNETTE: Commissioner Blue? 13 COMMISSIONER BLUE: 14 Yes. MS. BRUNETTE: Chair Hughes? 15 CHAIR HUGHES: Yes. 16 MS. BRUNETTE: Commissioner Perry? 17 COMMISSIONER PERRY: Aye. 18 MS. BRUNETTE: Commissioner Persico? 19 COMMISSIONER PERSICO: Yes. 20 Commissioner Tucker? MS. BRUNETTE: 21 COMMISSIONER TUCKER: Yes. 22 MS. BRUNETTE: Motion carries. The items are approved. 23 CHAIR HUGHES: OK. Thank you. Moving on to Surface 24 Transportation Committee. Met this morning. Tom George reviewed the 25 2022 Metro Performance Report. Went through some of the benchmarks 26 including ridership. Talked a little bit about how ridership is again 27

up this year. Kim is going to talk about the new bus purchases when we

get to the resolutions. John Schaefer gave the capital update. We liked the conversation about the Freedom Wall more than the escalators.

MULTIPLE COMMISSIONERS: Laughter.

MS. MINKEL:

CHAIR HUGHES:

So, we'll focus in on that. James Morrell gave us an update on the Citizens Advisory Committee including the Accessibility Advisory Committee group which is helping us out with the evolution of our website. Chief Patterson gave us a public safety report. And with that, we'll talk about the resolutions. Kim? Unless Tom or James? Anything else you guys want to add?

MR. MORRELL:

No. Just a briefly, the performance measures in terms of increasing ridership in a post-pandemic model that we are in.

Ridership is up but not as high as we were pre-pandemic.

CHAIR HUGHES: Great. Thank you. With that we have eleven (11) resolutions for your consideration.

MS. MINKEL: So, I just want to point out James, in starting his new role, is spending money, much quicker than anyone else. Eleven Resolutions!

Sorry James. I'm just teasing. The first one

MULTIPLE COMMISSIONERS: Laughter.

(1) is on page ninety-one (91). Staff is looking for an agreement with 4th Generation Construction. This is for our Freedom Wall Walk in the amount of \$734,000.00. I agree. John's presentation of this was much more exciting than the escalators. We saw the renderings earlier. It's a project we're very excited about. I should mention this is a project in total of just over \$900,000.00 soft costs are being paid for by the Authority in terms of our dedication towards the project. The establish

MBE, WBE, SDVOB are 25%, 5% and 2%. The  $4^{\rm th}$  Generation Construction identified their MBE participation as 30.8% and their WBE participation

as 5.4%. And they will be meeting the goal for SDVOB as well.

The second surface resolution is an authorization to award to Horizon Masonry Restoration. This is the Year 2 option, in the amount a little over \$210,000.00. This was a multi-year construction contract that previously the Board had awarded. This would be Year 2. As part of that agreement, this is to replace twenty-two personnel doors at both our Frontier Bus Garage and our Babcock Bus Garage. I do want to highlight for the Board that the cost of these door replacements, like everything else, went up. The increase that Horizon identified for this work is a 39.3% increase. Our Engineering group pulls the Bureau of Labor Statistics Producer Price Index which is showing the increase for producers actually went up 40% so it's in line with the KPI index that we're recommending.

The third resolution is an authorization to award Schindler Elevator to do, for them to do the replacement work on our University Station escalators in a lump sum amount of just over \$3 million. So, this would increase their total construction contract to just under \$17 million. As John identified earlier today, this is new work, this is outside the initial scope of the project. I just want to commend John and his team, because as part of the negotiation, they were able to negotiate a fee for the work at the same rate that we had paid for the other escalators, in spite of the fact that everything is going up. Really good work and certainly want to thank them, and after we do this here, this will get us out of the escalator business. We've had a lot of ups and downs. Sorry.

CHAIR HUGHES: Pun intended, alright.

MS. MINKEL: So, we will finally be out of escalators. On page ninety-seven (97), Staff is asking for ratification for our

college and university transit pass agreement with Bryant & Stratton. This is for their school years '22 through the end of '26. The reason this is a ratification is because they do have summer classes so their '22 school year actually began this month, a couple of weeks ago. We have had, as part of our CRAM pass, we've been with Bryant & Stratton for a number of years as we have with ECC and Buff State. The four (4) year agreement would work as follows: in year one (1), the pass would be \$55.00 per semester, year two (2) \$56.65, year three (3) \$58.35 and year four (4) \$60.10, with an average fee of \$57.53 for the student pass over the four (4) years. The existing four (4) year agreement that just expired had an average fee of \$51.44. And, we will be coming to you later in August with the other CRAM passes...

MR. MORRELL: Buff State and ECC.

MS. MINKEL: ...for ECC an Buff State. The fifth resolution is something that Darren Kempner mentioned as part of his report. Darren is a bit modest, so I am going to explain the significance of this grant to the agency. We were just awarded a federal grant of just under \$6,500.000.00 for this project. So, Staff is recommending an agreement with the Buffalo Niagara Medical Campus in the amount of just under the grant of \$6.4 million and an additional \$638,000.00 in in kind services that would be provided by the Buffalo Niagara Medical Campus to complete Phase 2 - which is the Design and Phase 3 - the Deployment here in Buffalo. So, what is this? This is our ability to test selfdriving shuttle service within Buffalo Niagara Medical Campus. So, as we talk about the shortage of human capital out there, using artificial intelligence and what that could mean to augment our services is really important not only to the region but also to our agency and this is a safe way to try it, see its success, and whether or not it makes sense

for future deployment in other areas. So, this is a project that we are excited about, I know Darren went over it quite quickly, I don't see him here...

CHAIR HUGHES: He's hiding over there.

MS. MINKEL: He's blending in with the scenery.

MULTIPLE COMMISSIONERS: Laughter.

MS. MINKEL:

It's really an exciting project for our agency and for the Buffalo Niagara Medical Campus. The next resolution on page one hundred (100) is an authorization to procure batteries from E1-Don Battery Post. This is replacement batteries, up to seven hundred (700), the cost not to exceed \$182,500.00. We did issue a bid. We received one (1) responsive proposal. The Empire State Development has excluded this procurement from MWBE requirement because there are no New York State providers of these goods and similarly it's been excluded for SDVOB requirements.

Resolution number seven (7) on page 101, Staff is looking for the authorization for additional bus charging equipment though NYPA through a construction contract in the amount just under \$5 million. This would install the equipment that's needed to charge the next resolution that I have which is to purchase fourteen (14) new battery electric buses. So, the requested charging equipment would provide six (6) new chargers and eighteen (18) overhead pantographs. So, with this additional work, the combined equipment and this work and the previous work that NYPA has done, we will have the capability of charging twenty-seven (27) battery electric buses at this facility. And there's still capacity to add more. We'll do so as we get more funding to buy more battery electric buses going forward. So, similarly on page 103, Staff is recommending that the Board authorize an agreement to purchase

the fourteen (14) battery electric buses from New Flyer at a cost not to exceed \$15,357,503.79. Back in February of last year, the Board had approved a five (5) year contract with New Flyer, giving us the option to purchase more battery electric buses during the term. These buses will replace buses from model year 2002, 2004 and 2005. I can't state enough the incredible work that our maintenance folks do, in keeping buses running. Tom talked about the useful life, James talked about the useful life in terms of what we have, that we get on our buses compared to what Federal Transit requires which is twelve (12) years is the useful life that Federal Transit has. A 2002, we're in '22. That is a twenty (20) year old bus that's still out there. So...

CHAIR HUGHES:

And these buses, these buses are not coming over night. These are taking longer and longer, these electric buses, correct?

MS. MINKEL:

Yes. Thank you very much. Yeah. Right now,
they're telling us late spring or early summer of next year, but I will
mention that the ten (10) buses that we're waiting on we were supposed
to get this spring, it got pushed to this summer, and now got pushed to
November because of supply chain issues. So, I am not really optimistic
that we will see them late spring, early summer, but it will be
wonderful if we do. For the geeks and the nerds out there, one of the
things I want to highlight about these buses have a special rear
mounted HVAC system that was specifically engineered and requested by
our resident engineer that includes ultraviolet A Light that kills
airborne pathogens. So, as we're coming out of the pandemic, it's
something we're still sensitive and you know there may be future
viruses out there and we want to do everything we can to improve air
quality and the air quality on the buses, so this has been incorporated

on these buses.

The 9<sup>th</sup> resolution is to purchase ten (10) diesel buses. This is from Nova Bus, that are manufactured here in New York State, here in Plattsburgh. The cost not to exceed \$6,265,780.20. Again, this will replace model years 2002, 2004, 2005. These buses will go and be housed at our Babcock Garage. We are required as part of our Title VI requirements with Federal Transit, to make certain that the age of our buses are equally distributed, so we needed to bring the age of our fleet at Babcock. Babcock we're not geared up to do electric charging, we'll be looking at it going forward, how we move it to zero-emissions buses, it may be to other technology, it may be battery, but this gets us to, keeps us in compliance with Title VI requirements for our bus age range.

Surface Resolution number ten (10), we had talked last month, Tom had presented, as part of a discussion item a pilot that we want to do working with both Erie and Niagara Counties to address those individuals who are part of the benefit lip. They are on the margin and so they make too much money, they don't qualify for some of the various social programs that would help with transportation. And we know next to housing, transportation is the most expensive cost for everyone out there. So, we anticipate working with the counties, that there will probably be a participation rate of around 250 individuals from a pool of over 1,500 individuals who are qualified. The cost to the Authority to provide them with half fare would be about \$10,000.00 a month in terms of lost fare revenue. This would be a one (1) year pilot, we would review it and then decide if it would be something to do going forward, if it's something that makes sense to continue.

CHAIR HUGHES: Kim, for those 250 people, the county

themselves, their social services department would notify them that they are eligible and that they should proceed with this? Or would we be targeting and showing them to go through their county social services to sign up?

MS. MINKEL: James, do you want to speak to that?

MR. MORRELL: Sure. So, what happens is they will validate those individuals and send them to us, and then we'll run them through our existing reduced fare program. So, it's an easy process, they already exist, and they'll send them over to us.

CHAIR HUGHES: OK. Thank you.

MS. MINKEL:

And then the final resolution, is a ratification of a fare waiver on routes #12 Utica, #13 Kensington, #18

Jefferson, #24 Genesee and this will take us through the end of July.

This is an extension of the fares that we waived previously for that community, for those individuals who have been impacted by the tragic events on May 14th. The positive impact being access to grocery stores but other things, mental health counseling, grief counseling, being able to connect with others in the community. This was certainly we received. I should also mention this also includes the paratransit community. The estimated lost fare revenue associated with this would be approximately \$350,000.00. This is on top of the \$100,000.00 for the previous month. So, the estimated loss in terms of revenue to the Authority is just under a half a million dollars. And those are the resolutions.

CHAIR HUGHES:

Just on number eleven (11), I know we have to determine the fare loss, but I think we should look at it as an investment in that community, you know they are going through tough times at this point.

MS. MINKEL: Yes. Yes. Absolutely. 1 CHAIR HUGHES: With that, we have eleven (11) resolutions that 2 we can take as a group if there is a motion. 3 COMMISSIONER BLUE: So moved. 4 COMMISSIONER PERSICO: Second. 5 CHAIR HUGHES: Motioned by Commissioner Blue. Second by 6 7 Commissioner Persico. Vicky, you want to call the roll please? MS. BRUNETTE: So, roll call vote for Surface Resolutions one 8 (1) through eleven (11). Commissioner Aul? 9 COMMISSIONER AUL: Yes. 10 MS. BRUNETTE: Commissioner Baynes? 11 COMMISSIONER BAYNES: Yes. 12 MS. BRUNETTE: Commissioner Blue? 13 COMMISSIONER BLUE: 14 Yes. MS. BRUNETTE: Chair Hughes? 15 CHAIR HUGHES: Yes, but I am going to abstain from number five 16 (5). 17 MS. BRUNETTE: Abstain from number five (5). Commissioner 18 Perry? 19 COMMISSIONER PERRY: I'm in the affirmative on all of them except 20 for number five (5). I abstain. 21 OK. Abstention noted. Commissioner Persico? MS. BRUNETTE: 22 COMMISSIONER PERSICO: Yes. 23 MS. BRUNETTE: And Commissioner Tucker? 24 COMMISSIONER TUCKER: Yes. 25 MS. BRUNETTE: The motion carries and the items are approved. 26 CHAIR HUGHES: Thank you. 27 28 COMMISSIONER BAYNES: Kim, can I just ask you a question? Why did we

buy diesel and electric? I don't know ...

MS. MINKEL: I'm sorry. Why did we buy diesel?

COMMISSIONER PERRY: Diesel and electric? Why both?

COMMISSIONER BAYNES: And not all electric?

MS. MINKEL: Yup. Yup. Electric is for our Cold Springs

facility that we are electrifying. Babcock is not electrified. And there is a Federal Transit requirement under Title VI that requires in all neighborhoods, you need to make certain that the age of the fleet is around the same age, that it isn't creating a disparate impact in different communities and so, there is no way for us to electrify Babcock or have other zero emission buses in a time frame, when you look at the age of the fleet for our Babcock facility so we recommend purchasing clean diesel. One point I forgot to make, so I really appreciate the question, is that there is a goal that New York State has that by 2035, any purchases going forward would be for zero emission buses. So, that, you know, given the life expectancy of a bus, we will be meeting that goal but that's why we have it parceled out. Diesel for some and electric for others.

COMMISSIONER BAYNES: Thank you.

COMMISSIONER PERRY: Clean diesel. Is that like for clean coal or

calorie-free chocolate?

MULTIPLE COMMISSIONERS: Laughter.

MS. MINKEL: Yeah. I understand the catalytic converter, the

filter on the buses is better with the clean diesel buses versus the

blue old diesel buses. But, still not as clean as zero emission buses.

COMMISSIONER PERRY: In all fairness, are they really zero

emissions? Because it depends on where the electricity is made.

Electricity is sometimes made with coal, sometimes made with petroleum

products, sometimes with nuclear or hydroelectric, with wind. So, it 1 2 really depends... And then you have the battery issues. MS. MINKEL: 3 COMMISSIONER PERRY: And the battery issues... that has a huge 4 economic impact, the actual production of batteries and the disposal of 5 batteries. So, we really have to think about it holistically. So, just 6 because it is diesel, doesn't mean it's bad. That isn't what you were 7 saying, it was a good question about the mixed supply... 8 COMMISSIONER BAYNES: Thank you. 9 MULTIPLE COMMISSIONERS: Laughter. 10 COMMISSIONER PERRY: ...but batteries... great question! 11 MS. MINKEL: And so, because of that, and the concern at the 12 Babcock facility, we are looking at zero emission buses, not saying 13 necessarily electric buses but hydrogen fuel may be an option. Or ... 14 COMMISSIONER PERRY: Well, like how about the Flintstones option? 15 MULTIPLE COMMISSIONERS: Laughter. 16 MS. MINKEL: That's zero emissions. 17 Electric buses, \$1.1 million, diesel, COMMMISSIONER BAYNES: 18 \$600,000.00. 19 MS. MINKEL: Yeah. That's right. That's right. 20 CHAIR HUGHES: OK. General Counsel's Report? 21 MS. BRUNETTE: Thank you Chair. We have just a brief update. 22 Last month I had advised the Board we were headed to trial. Should have 23 been starting on the  $21^{\rm st}$  of June. Jury selection was June 16 and 17. 24 Three (3) days before that jury selection date, we received a request 25 from Plaintiff's Counsel for an adjournment indicating his client 26 may have to go for another surgery, so the Court did grant that 27

28

adjournment. We just didn't want you wondering what happened with that

1	trial. So, we'll keep y	ou apprised of any updates.
2	CHAIR HUGHES:	Questions for Vicky? Is there a need for an
3	Executive Session? Kim,	scheduled update?
4	MS. MINKEL:	Yes. I just wanted to let the Board know that
5	there will be no Commit	tee or Board meeting in July. Instead,
6	the meeting has been mo	eved to August $11^{\mathrm{th}}$ . Well, I think it's already or
7	your calendar. I know I	Lara does a great job of reminding everyone. If
8	not, you will get a re	eminder that the meeting has been moved to August
9	11 <sup>th</sup> . So, enjoy your Ju	ly and we'll see you in August.
10	CHAIR HUGHES:	Before you go Commissioners, if we can, before
11	a motion to adjourn, ca	n we please do that in memory of Betsy Giles?
12	For those of you who ma	y remember, prior to COVID, she was a very
13	familiar face, a regula	ar attendee at Board Meetings. She was a Board
14	Member for the Citizens	s of Regional Transit who passed away in April,
15	so we thank her for her	advocacy and send her family our thoughts and
16	condolences. So, with t	chat, we'll entertain a motion to adjourn.
17	COMMISSIONER TUCKER:	I'll make a motion.
18	COMMISSIONER PERSICO:	Second.
19	CHAIR HUGHES:	Commissioner Tucker. Commissioner Persico. With
20	that, we are done. Thar	ık you.
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		
26		
27		